Appendixes

Appendix A: Search Strings and Priority Journals

Search Strategy for MEDLINE®

((minority groups[mh] OR ethnic groups[mh] OR urban health[mh] OR urban population[mh] OR minority[tiab] OR urban[tiab] OR inner-city[tiab] OR black*[tiab] OR african american*[tiab] OR mexican*[tiab] OR native*[tiab] OR indian*[tiab] OR latina[tiab] OR latino[tiab]) AND (nurs*[tiab] OR physician*[tiab] OR health professional*[tiab] OR health care provider*[tiab] OR health personnel[mh]) AND (randomized controlled trial [pt] OR controlled clinical trial [pt] OR randomized controlled trials [mh] OR random allocation [mh] OR double-blind method [mh] OR single-blind method [mh]) NOT (animal [mh] NOT human [mh])) OR ((cultura*[tiab] OR multicultural[tiab] OR transcultural[tiab] OR divers*[tiab] OR cultural diversity[mh] OR transcultural nursing[mh] OR ethnic[tw] OR minority[tw]) AND (competen*[tiab] OR sensitiv*[tiab] OR attitude*[tiab] OR experience[tiab] OR knowledge[tiab]) AND (education[mh] OR ed[sh] OR educat*[tiab] OR train*[tiab] OR curriculum[tiab]) AND (nurs*[tiab] OR physician*[tiab] OR health professional*[tiab] OR health care provider*[tiab] OR student*[tiab])) AND eng[la] AND 1980:2003[dp] NOT review[pt]

Search Strategy for the Cochrane CENTRAL Register of Controlled Trials

1 (minority or ethnic or (inner next city) or cultural) (1980 to current date)
2 ((health next professional) or physician or nurse) (1980 to current date)
3 1 and 2

Search Strategy for EMBASE

1	cultural.mp
2	"ETHNIC, RACIAL AND RELIGIOUS GROUPS"/ or ETHNIC DIFFERENCE/ or "ETHNIC OR RACIAL ASPECTS"/ or "ETHNIC AND RACIAL GROUPS"/ or ETHNIC GROUP/ or ethnic.mp.
3	MINORITY GROUP/ or minority.mp.
4	1 or 2 or 3
5	exp EDUCATION/ or education.mp.
6	4 and 5
7	health professional.mp. or Health Practitioner/
8	(physician or nurse).mp.
9	STUDENT/
10	7 or 8 or 9
11	6 and 10
12	cultural competence.mp
13	11 or 12
14	limit 13 to (human and english language)

Search Strategy for the Cumulative Index of Nursing and Alliance Health Literature (CINAHL)

((minority in TI,AB or ethnic in TI,AB or urban in TI,AB or inner-city in TI,AB or "Cultural-Diversity" / all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS / all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE or "Minority-Groups" /all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS /all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE or "Ethnic-Groups" /all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS /all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE or "Urban-Health" /all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS /all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE) and ("Health-Personnel" / all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS / all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE or health care provider* in TI,AB or nurs* in TI,AB or physician* in TI,AB or health professional* in TI,AB) and (LA:NU = ENGLISH) and (PY:NU >= 1980) AND ("clinical trials" /all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS /all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE)) or (("Education-" / all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS / all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE or educat* in TI,AB or train* in TI,AB or curriculum in TI,AB) and ("Transcultural-Nursing" / all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS / all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE or "Cultural-Diversity" / all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS / all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE or "Cultural-Sensitivity" / all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS / all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE or "Cultural-Competence" / all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS / all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE or ((cultura* in TI,AB or divers* in TI,AB) and (sensitiv* in TI,AB or attitude in TI,AB or knowledge in TI,AB or competen* in TI,AB))) and ("Health-Personnel" / all TOPICAL SUBHEADINGS / all AGE SUBHEADINGS in DE or "health care provider*" in TI,AB or nurs* in TI,AB or physician* in TI,AB or "health professional*" in TI,AB) and (LA:NU = ENGLISH) and (PY:NU >= 1980))

(minority OR ethnic OR cultural OR urban)

Search Strategy for the Research and Development Resource Base in Continuing Medical Education (RDRB/CME)

- selected indexed and non-indexed fields
- OR'd terms together

minority
cultural
racial

Journals Hand Searched

Academic Medicine

Archives of Pediatric and Adolescent Medicine

Ethnicity and Disease

Health Services Research

Journal of the American Medical Association

Journal of General Internal Medicine

Journal of Health Care for the Poor and Underserved

Journal of Transcultural Nursing

Medical Care

Milbank Quarterly

New England Journal of Medicine

Pediatrics

Appendix B: Abstraction Forms

EPC Minority Health
Abstract Review Form

Reviewer: _____

Data Entry: _____

Delete article because (check only one):

☐ published prior to 1980

☐ not in English

☐ does not include human data

☐ no original data

☐ meeting abstract (no full article for review)

☐ not relevant to minority health

(include <50% minority or no subgroup analysis)

☐ no intervention

☐ not targeted to health care providers or organizations

☐ has no evaluation of an intervention

☐ other: (specify) _____

Article addresses only quality question (Q1) and is:

☐ not RCT or concurrent CCT (non historical)

☐ not conducted in the U.S.

☐ **Unclear: get article to decide**

Do not go on if any item above is checked.

Article addresses following questions (check all that apply):

Strategies targeted at healthcare professionals to:

Quality

☐ improve *quality* of minority healthcare (Q1)

☐ *reducing disparities* in health or in healthcare (Q1a)

☐ *costs* of strategies (Q1b)

Cultural competence

☐ improve *cultural competence* of healthcare professionals (Q2)

☐ *costs* of strategies (Q2a)

☐ This article does not apply to any of the questions

☐ Get article for reference regarding:_____

Minority Health Article *Quality Assessment Form*

Article ID: _____ Reviewer 1:_____ Reviewer 2:_____

Section I: Article Eligibility: Review eligibility criteria before abstracting

Article is **not** eligible for review because (Check one):

- ○ published prior to 1980
- ○ not in English
- ○ does not include human data
- ○ no original data
- ○ meeting abstract (no full article for review)
- ○ not relevant to minority health (includes ≤ 50% minority OR no subgroup analysis)
- ○ no intervention
- ○ not targeted to health care providers or organizations
- ○ no evaluation of an intervention
- ○ this article does not apply to any of the questions
- ○ other: (specify)_____

Article addresses only quality (Q1) and is:

- ○ not RCT or concurrent CCT (non historical)
- ○ not conducted in the U.S.

IF ANY OF THE ABOVE ITEMS IS CHECKED, STOP: DO NOT CONTINUE

Section II: **Focus of Article**

Article provides information to address the following questions (Check all that apply):

Q1 Quality of Care ☐ What strategies targeted at health care providers or organizations, have been shown to improve minority health care quality? (Q1) ☐ Which of these strategies have been shown to be effective in reducing disparities in health or in health care between minority and white populations? (Q1a) ☐ What are the costs of these strategies? (Q1b)	Complete Quality Assessment Form AND the green Content Review Form
Q2 Cultural Competence ☐ What strategies have been shown to improve the cultural competence of health care providers or organizations? (Q2) ☐ What are the costs of these strategies? (Q2a)	Complete Quality Assessment Form AND the blue Content Review Form
☐ Article addresses intervention targeted to health care organizations **ONLY**	**STOP** and return the forms to Keo
☐ Article addresses intervention targeted at **BOTH** health care providers and organizations	Complete Quality Assessment Form AND the relevant Content Review Form for health care providers **only**

Section III: **Representativeness of Targeted Health Care Providers**

For each question, circle one response in the column on the right.

1. Does the study describe the setting and population from which the **health care providers** sample was drawn, and give the dates of the study? (e.g., clinic or hospital-based; nurses, dentists, physicians, etc.)	a. Adequate	(Setting AND population described AND start/end date specified)	2
	b. Fair	(One or more of these NOT reported OR poor description)	1
	c. Inadequate	(Not specified)	0

2. Was information provided on **health care providers** who were excluded or not participating in the intervention?	a. Adequate	(All reasons for exclusion/non participation AND number OR specified no exclusions/non participation)	2
	b. Fair	(Only one of above criteria specified or information not sufficient to allow replication)	1
	c. Inadequate	(None of the above criteria specified)	0
3. Does the study describe key **health care provider** characteristics at enrollment? *Demographics:* age, gender, specialty, race/ethnicity, years in practice or training level	a. Adequate	(Complete demographic description) (3-4 features)	2
	b. Fair	(Partial demographic description) (1-2 features)	1
	c. Inadequate	(No demographic features described)	0

Section IV: **Representativeness of Targeted Patients**

For each question, circle one numeric response.

4. Were **patients** involved in the study?	a. Yes	⇨ If yes, continue to Q5	
	b. No	⇨ If no, skip to Q7	
5. Does the study describe the setting and population from which the study sample of **patients** was drawn? (e.g., hospital/clinic OR community; all patients in practice; diabetics)	a. Adequate	(Setting AND population described)	2
	b. Fair	(One or more of these NOT reported OR poor description)	1
	c. Inadequate	(None Specified)	0
6. Does the study describe key **patient** characteristics? *Demographics:* age, gender, SES, race/ethnicity, comorbidity	a. Adequate	(Complete demographic description) (3-4 features)	2
	b. Fair	(Partial demographic description) (1-2 features)	1
	c. Inadequate	(No demographic features described)	0

Section V: **Bias and Confounding**

For each question, circle one response in the column on the right.

7. Was there an appropriate comparison group?	a. Adequate	(Concurrent and similar group)	2
	b. Fair	(Non-concurrent OR non-similar)	1
	c. Inadequate	(Non-concurrent AND non-similar)	0
	d. None	⇨Skip to item 11	0
8. Was assignment of participant groups randomized?	a. Adequate	(Investigators could not predict assignment)	2
	b. Partial	(Date of birth, admission date, hospital record number, or other non-random scheme for assignment, OR did not state)	1
	c. Not randomized		0
	d. Unclear		0
9. Did the **health care provider** group(s) have any important differences on key provider characteristics?	a. Groups equivalent in all factors examined OR appropriate adjustment		2
	b. Groups have minor difference in 1 or 2 factors		1.5
Demographics: age, gender, specialty, race/ethnicity, years in practice or level of training	c. Groups have an important difference in one or more factors OR minor difference in more than two factors		1
	d. Health care provider characteristics not reported		0
10. Did the **patient** group(s) have any important differences on key patient characteristics?	a. Groups equivalent in all factors examined OR appropriate adjustment		2
	b. Groups have minor difference in 1 or 2 factors		1.5
Demographics: age, gender, SES, race/ethnicity, comorbidity	c. Groups have an important difference in one or more factors OR minor difference in more than two factors		1
	d. Patient characteristics not reported		0
	e. Patients are not the unit of observation		N/A

Section VI: **Description of the Intervention**

For each question, circle one response in the column on the right.

11. Does the intervention have stated objectives?	a. Adequate	(Objectives stated clearly)	2
	b. Fair	(Objectives stated, but unclear)	1
	c. Inadequate	(Objectives not stated)	0
12. Was there a complete description of the intervention?	a. Adequate	(Intervention could be replicated given the completeness of description)	2
	b. Fair	(Some detail but insufficient to ensure replication)	1
	c. Inadequate	(Minimal to no detail)	0

Section VII: **Outcomes of the Intervention**

For each question, circle one response in the column on the right.

13. Was there blinding of outcome assessors?	a. Yes		2
	b. No		0
	c. No comparison group		N/A
14. Assessment of the intervention was based upon:	a. Pre- AND post-intervention evaluation		2
	b. Post-intervention evaluation		1
15. Were objective methods used to evaluate outcomes?	a. Adequate	(Evaluation methods were objective, e.g., statistics, written exams, video)	2
	b. Fair	(Objectivity of evaluation is questionable, e.g., de-briefing, self-assessment)	1
	c. Inadequate	(Evaluation methods not objective, e.g., participant essay OR methods unclear)	0

Section VIII: **Analytic Approach**

For each question, circle one response in the column on the right.

16. Did the study report the numbers of AND reasons for non-inclusion in the study analysis?	a. Numbers AND reasons for withdrawal reported or NO withdrawals	2
	b. Numbers OR reasons reported	1
	c. Neither numbers NOR reasons reported	0
17. What was the greatest percentage of **health care providers** in a study group that withdrew from the study protocol OR were lost to follow-up at the final evaluation?	a. < 10% withdrew or were lost to follow-up	2
	b. 10 - 30% withdrew or were lost	1
	c. > 30% withdrew or were lost	0
	d. Withdrawals/lost to follow-up not stated	0
	e. Providers not the unit of observation	N/A
18. What was the greatest percentage of **patients** in a study group that withdrew from the study protocol or were lost to follow-up?	a. < 10% withdrew or were lost to follow-up	2
	b. 10 - 30% withdrew or were lost to follow-up	1
	c. > 30% withdrew or were lost to follow-up	0
	d. Withdrawals/lost to follow-up not stated	0
	e. Patients are not the unit of observation	N/A
19. Was there differential loss to follow-up between groups?	a. No loss to follow-up OR no difference between groups	2
	b. Minor differences in loss to follow-up between groups	1
	c. Major differences in loss to follow-up between groups	0
	d. Withdrawals/loss to follow-up not stated	0
	e. No comparison group	N/A

Section IX: Statistical Quality and Interpretation

For each question, circle one response in the column on the right.

20. For primary endpoints of the evaluation, does the study report the magnitude of difference between groups (include pre post test) AND an index of variability - including pre-post testing (e.g., test statistic, p value, standard error, confidence interval)?	a. Adequate	(Both reported with index of variability using standard error or confidence intervals)	2
	b. Fair	(Both reported with index of variability using only test statistic or p value)	1
	c. Inadequate	(One or both not reported)	0
	d. No comparisons	(Descriptive analysis only)	0
	e. Qualitative analysis only		N/A
21. Were the appropriate analyses and statistical tests performed?	a. Adequate	(Yes, for all analyses)	2
	b. Fair	(Yes, but for only some of the analyses)	1
	c. Inadequate	(Not performed for any of the analyses OR not able to tell)	0
	d. Not applicable		N/A

THANK YOU! For completing this form. Please return to Keo.

Minority Health Content Review Form
for Key Question 1 (Quality)

Article ID: _____ Reviewer 1: _____ Reviewer 2: _____

1. What health care professionals are targeted? (Check all that apply)
   - ☐ Community health worker
   - ☐ Dentist
   - ☐ Nurse
   - ☐ Pharmacist
   - ☐ Physician
   - ☐ Other (specify): _____
   - ☐ Not specified

2. Training level? (Check all that apply)
   - ☐ Pre-professional training (medical/nursing student)
   - ☐ Resident/fellow
   - ☐ Professional (i.e., completed training)
   - ☐ Other (specify): _____
   - ☐ Not specified

3. Clinical specialty? (Check all that apply)
   - ☐ Emergency medicine
   - ☐ Family medicine
   - ☐ Internal medicine
   - ☐ Obstetrics and gynecology
   - ☐ Pediatrics
   - ☐ Primary care
   - ☐ Psychiatry
   - ☐ Surgery
   - ☐ Other (specify): _____
   - ☐ Not specified
   - ☐ N/A (for non-physicians and all students)

4. Where did the targeted health care provider(s) practice? (Check all that apply)
   - ☐ Community health center OR free standing clinic
   - ☐ Home/community (not health care setting)
   - ☐ Not specified
   - ☐ Other (specify): _____
   - ☐ Hospital inpatient
   - ☐ Hospital outpatient clinic
   - ☐ Group practice
   - ☐ Solo practice

5. What was the main objective of the study?_____

_____

_____

6. The objectives addressed which dimension of quality *(Refer to IOM definitions handout)*? (Check all that apply)

Consumer perspectives on health care needs	**Safety**	**Effectiveness**	**Patient centeredness**	**Timeliness**
Staying healthy	☐	☐	☐	☐
Getting better	☐	☐	☐	☐
Living with illness or disability	☐	☐	☐	☐
Coping with the end of life	☐	☐	☐	☐

7. Which of the following areas does this article address? (Check all that apply)

- ☐ Care coordination
- ☐ Asthma
- ☐ Children with special health care needs
- ☐ Hypertension
- ☐ Ischemic heart disease
- ☐ Medication management
- ☐ Pain control
- ☐ Mental illness
- ☐ Tobacco dependence
- ☐ End of life
- ☐ Self-management/health literacy
- ☐ Cancer screening
- ☐ Diabetes
- ☐ Frailty associated with old age
- ☐ Immunization
- ☐ Major depression (clinical depression)
- ☐ Nosocomial infections
- ☐ Pregnancy and childbirth
- ☐ Stroke
- ☐ Obesity
- ☐ Other _____

8. Study design? (Check one)

○ Randomized controlled trial (RCT) ○ Concurrent controlled trial (CCT)

9. Was assignment of the intervention made at the patient or provider level or both? (Check one)

○ Patients ○ Providers ○ Clinics

○ Both (patients and providers) ○ Both (providers and clinics)

10. How many groups, including the control group, are there in this study? _____ groups

11. Name, in one or two words, each group to be abstracted, e.g., control; nurse I; 4th year students. *Continue with this form and then complete a Group Description for Key Question 1 (pink sheets) for* ***each*** *group listed below.*

	Group name
Group A	Control
Group B	
Group C	
Group D	
Group E	
Group F	

12. Enter numbers for entire study (total for all groups). Enter "NS" where the number of participants is not specified and "NA" where not applicable, e.g., if no participants in study. *"# completed" refers to number of participants included in analysis for the entire study.*

Patients		**Providers**		**Clinics**	
# recruited	**# completed study**	**# recruited**	**# completed study**	**# recruited**	**# completed study**

13. When was the evaluation completed? (Check all that apply)

- ☐ < 1 day after end of intervention (includes immediate post test)
- ☐ 1 - 29 days after end of intervention
- ☐ 1 - 3 months after end of intervention
- ☐ 4 - 6 months after end of intervention
- ☐ 7 - 12 months after end of intervention
- ☐ > 1 year after end of intervention
- ☐ Not specified

14. Enter **patient** characteristics for the entire study as given, e.g., Ns OR %s, for entire study (total for all groups). Enter "NS" where the number of participants is not specified and "NA" where not applicable. Enter age range only if mean is not provided. If no patients in study, skip to item 16, next page. *Group level information must be entered on Group Description for Key Question 1 (pink sheets):*

☐ No patient information

	N	%
Female ☐ Not specified		
Asian/Pacific Islander ☐ Not specified		
African American ☐ Not specified		
Caucasian ☐ Not specified		
Hispanic ☐ Not specified		
American Indian/Alaskan Native ☐ Not specified		

	Mean	Range
Age ☐ Not specified		
Years of education ☐ Not specified		

15. Outcomes of the provider targeted intervention assessed by (check one):

○ Patient outcomes ○ Provider outcomes ○ Both

16. What health care quality outcomes related to the intervention objectives were assessed and how measured?
Outcome type codes: Utilization = U; Quality of Providers = QP; Appropriateness of Care = AC; Efficacy of Treatment = ET; Patient Adherence = PA; Health Status = HS; Patient Satisfaction = PS. *This item continued next page for additional outcomes.*

Outcome type (select code from list above)	**Outcome** (e.g., physician counseling behavior, immunization rates, cancer screening tests, etc.)	**How measured** (e.g., provider self report, medical record review, patient report, administrative or claims, etc.)	**Intervention effects** (specify group comparison outcomes)

16 (Continued). What health care quality outcomes related to the intervention objectives were assessed and how measured?
Outcome type codes: Utilization = U; Quality of Providers = QP; Appropriateness of Care = AC; Efficacy of Treatment = ET; Patient Adherence = PA; Health Status = HS; Patient Satisfaction = PS.

Outcome type (select code from list above)	**Outcome** (e.g., physician counseling behavior, immunization rates, cancer screening tests, etc.)	**How measured** (e.g., provider self report, medical record review, patient report, administrative or claims, etc.)	**Intervention effects** (specify group comparison outcomes, refer to question 10)

17. Author conclusion/summary: (Check one)

- ○ Overall improvement after intervention
- ○ Partial improvement or mixed results
- ○ No improvement after intervention
- ○ Unclear
- ○ Other (specify): _____

18. Briefly summarize the authors' main conclusion(s): _____

_____

_____

19. Reflecting back on this study as a whole, what is your overall impression of the quality of the study? (Check one)

- ○ Very good
- ○ Fair
- ○ Poor

20. Any other comments for us?

_____

_____

_____

Thank you ....and please continue.

Complete a Group Description form (pink sheets) for each group (A-F) listed in Item 11, page 3, MH Content Review Form for KQ1.

When all forms are completed, please assemble them and bring them to the next meeting.

Minority Health Content Review Form
GROUP *Description for Key Question 1 (Quality)*

Article ID: _____ Reviewer 1: _____ Reviewer 2: _____

Group (from Item 11, p 3, MH Content Review Form for KQ1. Circle): A B C D E F

Group Name (from Item 11, p 3, MH Content Review Form for KQ1.) _____

1G. Enter **patient** characteristics as given, e.g., Ns OR %s. Enter "NS" where the number of participants is not specified and "NA" where not applicable. Enter age range only if mean is not provided. *If no patients in study, skip to item 2G, next page.*

☐ No patient information

	N	%
Female ☐ Not specified		
Asian/Pacific Islander ☐ Not specified		
African American ☐ Not specified		
Caucasian ☐ Not specified		
Hispanic ☐ Not specified		
American Indian/Alaskan Native ☐ Not specified		

	Mean	Range
Age ☐ Not specified		
Years of education ☐ Not specified		

2G. Briefly describe the group intervention described on this form. Identify whether usual care or provider or patient focus. Enter "NS" where number of participants is not specified and "NA" where not applicable. *"# completed" refers to total # included in analysis for this group.*

Column 1			**Column 2**
Patients # recruited / # completed	**Providers** # recruited / # completed	**Clinics** # recruited / # completed	Indicate group type and provide brief group description, e.g., providers given computer reminders; patients given written material)
			☐ No intervention/usual care
			☐ Provider intervention
			☐ Patient intervention

3G. Were there *educational* methods used in the provider intervention?

☐ Yes (Continue to item 4G) ☐ No educational methods (Skip to item 8G)

4G. Educational methods used: (Check all that apply)

☐ Written material (book, flyer, journal, article)

☐ AV material (audiotape, videotape, guidelines, case studies)

☐ Computer-based material (CD, software, Internet)

☐ Lecture

☐ Self-study

☐ Small group

☐ Simulated patients

☐ Academic detailing

☐ Other_____

5G. Number of training sessions for the *main educational intervention*? _____ sessions ☐ N/S

6G. What was the average duration for *one* training session for the *main educational intervention?*

- ○ < 2 hours
- ○ 2 - 10 hours
- ○ 11 - 20 hours
- ○ > 20 hours
- ○ Not specified

7G. How often were the sessions held for the *main educational intervention*?

- ○ Once only
- ○ Weekly
- ○ Monthly
- ○ Other (specify): _____
- ○ Not specified

8G. What *other* methods were used? (check all that apply)

- ☐ No other methods used
- ☐ Tracking/reminder system
- ☐ Audit & feedback
- ☐ Standing orders/protocols/guidelines/algorithms
- ☐ Reward incentive
- ☐ Penalty incentive
- ☐ Other (describe): _____

9G. How much time elapsed from the beginning to the end of the intervention?

- ○ < 1 day
- ○ 1 - 29 days
- ○ 1 - 3 months
- ○ 4 - 6 months
- ○ 7 - 12 months
- ○ > 1 year
- ○ Not specified

10G. Comments about intervention if not captured by previous questions (i.e., brief description intervention, including duration and frequency).

Thank you ....and please continue.

Complete a Group Description form (pink sheets) for *each* group (A-F) listed in Item 11, page 3, MH Content Review Form for KQ1.

When all forms are completed, please assemble them and bring them to the next meeting.

Minority Health Content Review Form for
Key Question 2 (Cultural Competence)

Article ID: _____ Reviewer 1: _____ Reviewer 2: _____

1. What health care professionals are targeted? (Check all that apply)
   - ☐ Community health worker
   - ☐ Dentist
   - ☐ Nurse
   - ☐ Pharmacist
   - ☐ Physician
   - ☐ Other (specify): _____
   - ☐ Not specified

2. Training level? (Check all that apply)
   - ☐ Pre-professional training (medical/nursing student)
   - ☐ Resident/fellow
   - ☐ Practicing professional (i.e., completed training)
   - ☐ Other (Specify): _____
   - ☐ Not specified

3. Study design? (Check one)
   - a. Controlled trial
     - ○ Randomized controlled trial (RCT)
     - ○ Concurrent controlled trial (CCT)
   - b. Uncontrolled
     - ○ Pre/post test
     - ○ Post test only
   - c. Other (specify): _____
   - d. Not specified

4. In what part of the world was the intervention mainly performed? (Check all that apply)
   - ☐ Africa
   - ☐ Asia
   - ☐ Australia
   - ☐ Canada
   - ☐ Mexico, South or Central America
   - ☐ U.K.
   - ☐ U.S.
   - ☐ Other (specify): _____
   - ☐ Not specified

5. What was the setting of the educational intervention? (Check all that apply)

- ☐ Continuing medical education/ continuing nursing education
- ☐ Health professional school
- ☐ Professional meeting/conference
- ☐ Residency program
- ☐ Not specified
- ☐ Other (specify): _____
- ☐ Ambulatory health care setting
- ☐ Community health clinic
- ☐ Community (includes cultural immersion)
- ☐ Hospital
- ☐ Workshop

6. What are the educational objectives of the intervention?

Objectives (✔ all that apply)	**Describe briefly (use key words and point form)**
☐ Knowledge	
☐ Attitudes/Beliefs	
☐ Skills	
☐ Behaviors	
☐ Patient outcomes	

7. What **methods** were used in the intervention? (Check all that apply)

- ☐ Audio/visual (e.g. videotapes)
- ☐ Brainstorming
- ☐ Case scenarios
- ☐ Clinical experiences
- ☐ Culture immersion
- ☐ Demonstration/role modeling
- ☐ Discussion (group)
- ☐ Drill/practice exercise
- ☐ Interviewing members of another culture
- ☐ Language lessons
- ☐ Lectures
- ☐ Other (specify): _____
- ☐ Literature (poems, stories)
- ☐ Presentations by community members, members of another culture
- ☐ Problem based learning
- ☐ Readings
- ☐ Role play
- ☐ Standardized patient (includes OSCEs)
- ☐ Self reflection/awareness
- ☐ Self study
- ☐ Small group
- ☐ Not specified

8. How was the intervention developed? (Check all that apply)

- ☐ Literature review
- ☐ Guidelines
- ☐ Focus groups
- ☐ Expert opinion
- ☐ Learner input
- ☐ Theoretical model (specify): _____
- ☐ Other (specify): _____
- ☐ Not specified

9. How many training sessions were held?

_____

○ Not specified

10. What was the average duration for one training session (i.e., contact time)?

- ○ < 2 hours
- ○ 2 - 10 hours
- ○ 11 - 20 hours
- ○ > 20 hours
- ○ Not specified

11. How often were the sessions held?

- ○ Once only
- ○ Weekly
- ○ Monthly
- ○ Other (specify): _____
- ○ Not specified

12. When was the evaluation completed? (Check all that apply)

- ☐ < 1 day after end of intervention (includes immediate post test)
- ☐ 1 - 29 days after end of intervention
- ☐ 1 - 3 months after end of intervention
- ☐ 4 - 6 months after end of intervention
- ☐ 7 - 12 months after end of intervention
- ☐ > 1 year after end of intervention
- ☐ Not specified

13. Comments about intervention if not captured by previous questions (i.e., briefly describe intervention, including duration and frequency).

14. Methods used in evaluation of this intervention: (Check all that apply)

- ☐ Computer interactive tests
- ☐ Essays
- ☐ Group interviews
- ☐ Individual interviews
- ☐ Observer/rater questionnaire (includes family)
- ☐ Performance audits
- ☐ Participant ratings of curriculum
- ☐ Patient rating
- ☐ Self-assessment forms
- ☐ Video or audiotape feedback/analysis
- ☐ Written exam
- ☐ Other (specify): _____
- ☐ Not specified

15. What were the outcomes?

(✔ all that apply)	**Briefly describe the outcomes including differential outcomes for comparison groups, if relevant.**
☐ Knowledge	
☐ Attitudes/Beliefs	
☐ Skills	
☐ Behaviors	
☐ Patient outcomes	
☐ Curriculum evaluation	
☐ Other	

16. Author conclusion/summary:

- ☐ Overall improvement after intervention
- ☐ Partial improvement or mixed results
- ☐ No improvement after intervention
- ☐ Unclear
- ☐ Other (specify): _____

17. Briefly summarize the authors' main conclusion(s):

_____

_____

_____

18. Reflecting back on this study as a whole, what is your overall impression of the quality of the study?

- ☐ Very Good
- ☐ Fair
- ☐ Poor

19. Any other comments for us?

_____

_____

_____

THANK YOU! For completing this form. Please return to Keo.

Appendix C: Evidence Tables

Included Studies

Ahluwalia LS, Gibson CA, Kenney RE, et al. Smoking status as a vital sign. J Gen Intern Med 1999; 14: 402-408.

Allen B Jr, Pederson LL, and Leonard EH. Effectiveness of physicians-in-training counseling for smoking cessation in African Americans. J Natl Med Assoc 1998; 90(10): 597-604.

Alpers RR, Zoucha R. Comparison of cultural competence and cultural confidence of senior nursing students in a private southern university. J Cult Divers 1996; 3(1): 9-15.

Barton JA, Brown NJ. Evaluation study of a transcultural discovery learning model. Public Health Nurs 1992; 9(4): 234-41.

Beagan BL. Teaching Social and Cultural Awareness to Medical Students: "It's All Very Nice to Talk about It in Theory, But Ultimately It Makes No Difference". Acad Med 2003; 78(6): 605-14.

Bengiamin MI, Downey VW, and Heuer LJ. Continuing education. Transcultural healthcare: a phenomenological study of an educational experience. J Cult Divers 1999; 6(2): 60-8.

Berman A, Manning MP, Peters E, et al. A template for cultural diversity workshops. Oncol Nurs Forum 1998; 25(10): 1711-8.

Blackford J, Street A. Cultural conflict: the impact of western feminism(s) on nurses caring for women of non-English speaking background. J Clin Nurs 2002; 11(5): 664-71.

Bond ML, Jones ME. Short-term cultural immersion in Mexico. Nurs Health Care 1994; 15(5): 248-53.

Briscoe VJ, Pichert JW. Evaluation of a program to promote diabetes care via existing agencies in African American communities. ABNF J 1999; 10(5): 111-5.

Browne CV, Braun KL, Mokuau N, et al. Developing a multisite project in geriatric and/or gerontological education with emphases in interdisciplinary practice and cultural competence. Gerontologist 2002; 42(5): 698-704.

Burack RC, Gimotty PA. Promoting screening mammography in inner-city settings. The sustained effectiveness of computerized reminders in a randomized controlled trial. Med Care 1997; 35(9): 921-31.

Burack RC, Gimotty PA, George J, et al. How reminders given to patients and physicians affected pap smear use in a health maintenance organization: results of a randomized controlled trial. Cancer 1998; 82(12): 2391-400.

Burack RC, Gimotty PA, George J, et al. The effect of patient and physician reminders on use of screening mammography in a health maintenance organization. Results of a randomized controlled trial. Cancer 1996; 78(8): 1708-21.

Burack RC, Gimotty PA, George J, et al. Promoting screening mammography in inner-city settings: a randomized controlled trial of computerized reminders as a component of a program to facilitate mammography. Med Care 1994; 32(6): 609-24.

Burack RC, Gimotty PA, Simon M, et al. The effect of adding Pap smear information to a mammography reminder system in an HMO: results of randomized controlled trial. Prev Med 2003; 36(5): 547-54.

Burge SK, Amodei N, Elkin B, et al. An evaluation of two primary care interventions for alcohol abuse among Mexican-American patients. Addiction 1997; 92(12): 1705-16.

Callahan CM, Hendrie HC, Dittus RS, et al. Improving treatment of late life depression in primary care: a randomized clinical trial. J Am Geriatr Soc 1994; 42(8): 839-46.

Campinha-Bacote J, Yahle T, and Langenkamp M. The challenge of cultural diversity for nurse educators. J Contin Educ Nurs 1996; 27(2): 59-64.

Chambers CV, Balaban DJ, Carlson BL, et al. Microcomputer-generated reminders. Improving the compliance of primary care physicians with mammography screening guidelines. J Fam Pract 1989; 29(3): 273-80.

Chevannes M. Issues in educating health professionals to meet the diverse needs of patients and other service users from ethnic minority groups. J Adv Nurs 2002; 39(3): 290-8.

Copeman RC. Medical students, Aborigines and migrants: evaluation of a teaching programme. Med J Aust 1989; 150(2): 84-7.

Crandall SJ, George G, Marion GS, et al. Applying theory to the design of cultural competency training for medical students: a case study. Acad Med 2003; 78(6): 588-94.

Culhane-Pera KA, Reif C, Egli E, et al. A curriculum for multicultural education in family medicine. Fam Med 1997; 29(10): 719-23.

Dexter PR, Wolinsky FD, Gramelspacher GP, et al. Effectiveness of computer-generated reminders for increasing discussions about advance directives and completion of advance directive forms. A randomized, controlled trial. Ann Intern Med 1998; 128(2): 102-10.

Dietrich AJ, Tobin JN, Sox CH, et al. Cancer early-detection services in community health centers for the underserved. A randomized controlled trial. Arch Fam Med 1998; 7(4): 320-7; discussion 328.

Dogra N. The development and evaluation of a programme to teach cultural diversity to medical undergraduate students. Med Educ 2001; 35(3): 232-41.

Douglas KC, Lenahan P. Ethnogeriatric assessment clinic in family medicine. Fam Med 1994; 26(6): 372-5.

Dowell A, Crampton P, and Parkin C. The first sunrise: an experience of cultural immersion and community health needs assessment by undergraduate medical students in New Zealand. Med Educ 2001; 35(3): 242-9.

Drouin J, Rivet C. Training medical students to communicate with a linguistic minority group. Acad Med 2003; 78(6): 599-604.

Erkel EA, Nivens AS, and Kennedy DE. Intensive immersion of nursing students in rural interdisciplinary care. J Nurs Educ 1995; 34(8): 359-65.

Evans D, Mellins R, Lobach K, et al. Improving care for minority children with asthma: professional education in public health clinics. Pediatrics 1997; 99(2): 157-64.

Farnill D, Todisco J, Hayes SC, et al. Videotaped interviewing of non-English speakers: training for medical students with volunteer clients. Med Educ 1997; 31(2): 87-93.

Felder E. Baccalaureate and associate degree student nurses' cultural knowledge of and attitudes toward black American clients. J Nurs Educ 1990; 29(6): 276-82.

Flavin C. Cross-cultural training for nurses: a research-based education project. Am J Hosp Palliat Care 1997 May-Jun; 14(3): 121-6.

Frank-Stromborg M, Johnson J, and McCorkle R. A program model for nurses involved with cancer education of black Americans. J Cancer Educ 1987; 2(3): 145-51.

Frisch NC. An international nursing student exchange program: an educational experience that enhanced student cognitive development. J Nurs Educ 1990; 29(1): 10-2.

Gallagher Thompson D, Haynie D, Takagi KA, et al. Impact of an Alzheimer's disease education program: focus on Hispanic families. Gerontol Geriatr Educ 2000; 20(3): 25-40.

Gany F, de Bocanegra HT. Maternal-child immigrant health training: changing knowledge and attitudes to improve health care delivery. Patient Educ Couns 1996; 27(1): 23-31.

Gemson DH, Ashford AR, Dickey LL, et al. Putting prevention into practice. Impact of a multifaceted physician education program on preventive services in the inner city. Arch Intern Med 1995; 155(20): 2210-6.

Gielen AC, Wilson ME, McDonald EM, et al. Randomized trial of enhanced anticipatory guidance for injury prevention. Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med 2001; 155(1): 42-9.

Godkin M, Savageau J. The effect of medical students' international experiences on attitudes toward serving underserved multicultural populations. Fam Med 2003; 35(4): 273-8.

Godkin MA, Savageau JA. The effect of a global multiculturalism track on cultural competence of preclinical medical students. Fam Med 2001; 33(3): 178-86.

Hadwiger SC. Cultural competence case scenarios for critical care nursing education. Nurse Educ 1999; 24(5): 47-51.

Haloburdo EP, Thompson MA. A comparison of international learning experiences for baccalaureate nursing students: developed and developing countries. J Nurs Educ 1998; 37(1): 13-21.

Hansen ND. Teaching cultural sensitivity in psychological assessment: a modular approach used in a distance education program. J Pers Assess 2002; 79(2): 200-6.

Haq C, Rothenberg D, Gjerde C, et al. New world views: preparing physicians in training for global health work. Fam Med 2000; 32(8): 566-72.

Harris LE, Luft FC, Rudy DW, et al. Effects of multidisciplinary case management in patients with chronic renal insufficiency. Am J Med 1998; 105(6): 464-71.

Harris R, Mackenzie T, Leeman-Castillo B, et al. Optimizing antibiotic prescribing for acute respiratiory tract infections in an urban urgent care clinic. J Gen Intern Med 2003; 18: 326-334 .

Hornberger JC, Gibson CD Jr, Wood W, et al. Eliminating language barriers for non-English-speaking patients. Med Care 1996; 34(8): 845-56.

Inglis A, Rolls C, and Kristy S. The impact on attitudes towards cultural difference of participation in a health focused study abroad program. Contemp Nurse 2000; 9(3-4): 246-55.

Jeffreys MR. A transcultural core course in the clinical nurse specialist curriculum. Clin Nurse Spec 2002; 16(4): 195-202.

Jeffreys MR, Smodlaka I. Changes in students' transcultural self-efficacy perceptions following an integrated approach to culture care. J Multicul Nurs Health 1999; 5(2): 6-12.

Kellermann AL, Hackman BB, Somes G, et al. Impact of first-responder defibrillation in an urban emergency medical services system. JAMA 1993; 270(14): 1708-13.

Keyserling TC, Ammerman AS, Davis CE, et al. A randomized controlled trial of a physician-directed treatment program for low-income patients with high blood cholesterol: the Southeast Cholesterol Project. Arch Fam Med 1997; 6(2): 135-45.

Lasch KE, Wilkes G, Lee J, et al. Is hands-on experience more effective than didactic workshops in postgraduate cancer pain education? J Cancer Educ 2000; 15(4): 218-22.

Lindquist GJ. A cross-cultural experience: comparative study in nursing and health care. J Nurs Educ 1984; 23(5): 212-4.

Lockhart JS, Resick LK. Teaching cultural competence. The value of experiential learning and community resources. Nurse Educ 1997; 22(3): 27-31.

Mandelblatt J, Traxler M, Lakin P, et al. A nurse practitioner intervention to increase breast and cervical cancer screening for poor, elderly black women. The Harlem Study Team. J Gen Intern Med 1993; 8(4): 173-8.

Manfredi C, Czaja R, Freels S, et al. Prescribe for health. Improving cancer screening in physician practices serving low-income and minority populations. Arch Fam Med 1998; 7(4): 329-37.

Mao C, Bullock CS, Harway EC, et al. A workshop on ethnic and cultural awareness for second-year students. J Med Educ 1988; 63(8): 624-8.

Marvel MK, Grow M, and Morphew P. Integrating

family and culture into medicine: a family systems block rotation. Fam 1993; 25(7): 441-442.

Mazor SS, Hampers LC, Chande VT, et al. Teaching Spanish to pediatric emergency physicians: Effects on patient satisfaction. Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med 2002; 156(7): 693-695.

McCarthy BD, Yood MU, Bolton MB, et al. Redesigning primary care processes to improve the offering of mammography. The use of clinic protocols by nonphysicians. J Gen Intern Med 1997; 12(6): 357-63.

McDonald CJ, Hui SL, Smith DM, et al. Reminders to physicians from an introspective computer medical record. A two-year randomized trial. Ann Intern Med 1984; 100(1): 130-8.

Miranda J, Duan N, Sherbourne C, et al. Improving care for Minorities: Can Quality Improvement Interventions Improve Care and Outcomes for Depressed Minorites? Results of a Randomized, Controlled Trial. Health Serv Res 2003; 38(2): 613-630.

Napholz L. A comparison of self-reported cultural competency skills among two groups of nursing students: implications for nursing education. J Nurs Educ 1999; 38(2): 81-3.

Nora LM, Daugherty SR, Mattis-Peterson A, et al. Improving cross-cultural skills of medical students through medical school-community partnerships. West J Med 1994; 161(2): 144-7.

Oneha MF, Sloat A, Shoultz J, et al. Community partnerships: redirecting the education of undergraduate nursing students. J Nurs Educ 1998; 37(3): 129-35.

Rolls C, Inglis A, and Kristy S. Study abroad programs: creating awareness of and changing attitudes to nursing, health and ways of living in other cultures. Contemp Nurse 1997; 6(3-4): 152-6.

Rooda L, Gay G. Staff development for culturally sensitive nursing care. J Nurs Staff Dev 1993; 9(6): 262-5 .

Rubenstein HL, O'Connor BB, Nieman LZ, et al. Introducing students to the role of folk and popular health belief- systems in patient care. Acad Med 1992; 67(9): 566-8.

Ryan M, Ali N, and Carlton KH. Community of Communities: an electronic link to integrating cultural diversity in nursing curriculum. J Prof Nurs 2002; 18(2): 85-92.

Ryan M, Twibell R, Brigham C, et al. Learning to care for clients in their world, not mine. J Nurs Educ 2000; 39(9): 401-8.

Schubiner H, Tzelepis A, Wright K, et al. The clinical utility of the Safe Times Questionnaire. J Adolesc Health 1994; 15(5): 374-82.

Scisney-Matlock M. Systematic methods to enhance diversity knowledge gained: a proposed path to professional richness. J Cult Divers 2000; 7(2): 41-7.

Sinnott MJ, Wittmann B. An introduction to indigenous health and culture: the first tier of the Three Tiered Plan. Aust J Rural Health 2001; 9(3): 116-20.

Smith LS. Evaluation of an educational intervention to increase cultural competence among registered nurses. J Cult Divers 2001; 8(2): 50-63.

St Clair A, McKenry L. Preparing culturally competent practitioners. J Nurs Educ 1999; 38(5): 228-34.

Stumphauzer JS, Davis LC. Training community-based, Asian-American mental health personnel in behavior modification. J Community Psychol 1983; 11(3): 253-8.

Tang TS, Fantone JC, Bozynski ME, et al. Implementation and evaluation of an undergraduate Sociocultural Medicine Program. Acad Med 2002; 77(6): 578-85.

Tomlinson-Clarke S. Assessing outcomes in a multicultural training course: A qualitative study. Couns Psychol 2000; 13(2): 221-231.

Turner BJ, Day SC, and Borenstein B. A controlled trial to improve delivery of preventive care: physician or patient reminders? J Gen Intern Med 1989; 4(5): 403-9.

Underwood SM. Development of a cancer prevention and early detection program for nurses working with African Americans. J Contin Educ Nurs 1999; 30(1): 30-6.

Underwood SM, Dobson A. Cancer prevention and early detection program for educators: reducing the cancer burden of among African Americans within the academic arena. J Natl Black Nurses Assoc 2002; 13(1): 45-55.

Velde BP, Wittman PP. Helping occupational therapy students and faculty develop cultural competence. Occ Ther Health Car 2001; 13(3-4): 23-32.

Wade P, Berstein B. Culture sensitivity training and counselor's race: effects on black female client's perceptions and attrition. J Couns Psychol 1991; 38: 9-15.

Warner JR. Cultural competence immersion experiences: public health among the Navajo. Nurse Educ 2002; 27(4): 187-90.

Way BB, Stone B, Schwager M, et al. Effectiveness of the New York State Office of Mental Health Core Curriculum: Direct care staff training. Psychiatr Rehabil J 2002; 25(4): 398-402.

Wendler MC, Struthers R. Bridging culture on-line: Strategies for teaching cultural sensitivity. J Prof Nurs 2002; 18(6): 320-7.

Williamson E, Stecchi JM, Allen BB, et al. Multiethnic experiences enhance nursing students' learning. J Community Health Nurs 1996; 13(2): 73-81.

Appendix D: Peer Reviewers

First Name	Last Name	Affiliation
Partner		
Helen	Wu	National Quality Forum
Internal Peer Reviewer - Johns Hopkins University		
Martha	Hill	Johns Hopkins University School of Nursing
Technical Experts		
Laura	Petersen	Houston VA Medical Center, Baylor College of Medicine
Kevin	Fiscella	Departments of Family and Community & Preventive Medicine, University of Rochester School of Medicine
Robert	Beltran	Latino Medical Policy Institute
Anne	Beal	Commonwealth Fund
Marsha	Lillie-Blanton	Kaiser Family Foundation
Peer Reviewers		
Robert	Like	Center for Healthy Families and Cultural Diversity, Department of Family Medicine, UMDNJ - Robert Wood Johnson Medical School
Spero	Manson	American Indian and Alaska Native Programs, University of Colorado Health Sciences Center
Jeanette	South-Paul	University of Pittsburgh School of Medicine, Department of Family Medicine
Dawn	Clancy	Department of Medicine, Medical University of South Carolina, Center for Healthcare Research
Debra	Danoff	American Association of Medical Colleges
Denice	Cora-Bramble	Children's National Medical Center
Pamela	Dickson	The Robert Wood Johnson Foundation
Internal Experts		
Debra	Roter	Department of Health Policy and Management, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health
Haya	Rubin	Quality of Care Research, Johns Hopkins University
Jon	Samet	Department of Epidemiology, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health