1	WILLIAM E. KOVACIC	
2	General Counsel	
3	ROBERT SUSSMAN WALTER GROSS III	
4	AMY LLOYD Attorneys for the Plaintiff	
5	Federal Trade Commission	
6	600 Pennsylvania Avenue N.W. Washington, D.C. 20580	
7	(202) 326-2747 - RS (202) 326-3319 - WG (202) 326- 2559 - fax	
8	JOHN D. JACOBS	
9	Cal. Bar. No.134154 10877 Wilshire Boulevard	
10	Suite 700	
11	Los Angeles, California 90024 (310) 824-4360	
12	(310) 824-4380 - fax	
13	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
14	FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA	
15		-
16	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,) CIVIL ACTION NO.
17	Plaintiff,)
18	V.) COMPLAINT FOR PERMANENT
19	ELECTRONIC PRODUCTS DISTRIBUTION,) INJUNCTION AND OTHER) EQUITABLE RELIEF
20	L.L.C., ENERGIZER PRODUCTS, INC.,)
21	ABFLEX USA, INC.,	,)
22	AB ENERGIZER, L.L.C., THOMAS C. NELSON,)
23	HOLLY HERNANDEZ, a/k/a HOLLY BRYAN,)
24	and MARTIN VAN DER HOEVEN,)
25	Defendants.))
26		, _)
27		
28		

Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC"), through its undersigned attorneys, alleges as follows:

1

2

3 1. Plaintiff FTC brings this action under Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), to secure a permanent injunction, consumer redress, 4 5 disgorgement, and other equitable relief against the Defendants for engaging in deceptive acts or practices in connection with the advertising, marketing, and sale of the AB Energizer electronic 6 7 exercise belt ("AB Energizer"), which purports to cause loss of weight, fat, and inches, and highly developed abdominal muscles, in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. 8 9 §§ 45(a) and 52. 10 11 JURISDICTION AND VENUE 12 2. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 52, and 53(b), and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1337(a), and 1345. 13 3. Venue in this district is proper under 15 U.S.C. § 53(b) and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1391(b) and 14 15 (c). 16 17 THE PARTIES 18 4. Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission, is an independent agency of the United States 19 Government created by statute. See 15 U.S.C. §§ 41-58. The FTC enforces Section 5(a) of the 20 FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), which prohibits unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting 21 commerce. The FTC also enforces Section 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 52, which prohibits 22 false advertisements for food, drugs, devices, services, or cosmetics in or affecting commerce. The 23 FTC may initiate federal district court proceedings to enjoin violations of the FTC Act and to 24 secure such equitable relief, including consumer redress, as may be appropriate in each case. 15 25 U.S.C. § 53(b). 5. Defendant Electronic Products Distribution, L.L.C. ("EPD") is a California limited 26 27 liability company located at 7975 Raytheon Road, Suite 380, San Diego, California. At all times

28 relevant to this Complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, EPD has manufactured,

marketed, and sold devices it has promoted as exercise equipment, including the AB Energizer.
 EPD transacts or has transacted business in the Southern District of California.

6. Defendant Energizer Products, Inc. ("Energizer") is a California corporation located at
 18375 Ventura Boulevard, Suite 403, Tarzana, California. At all times relevant to this Complaint,
 acting alone or in concert with others, Energizer has marketed and sold the AB Energizer.
 Energizer transacts or has transacted business in the Southern District of California.

7 7. Defendant Abflex USA, Inc. ("Abflex") is a California corporation located at 7975
8 Raytheon Road, Suite 380, San Diego, California, and 445 Marine Avenue, Del Mar, California.
9 Abflex owns the Ab Energizer trademark and registered the website for AB Energizer,
10 www.abenergizer.com. At all times relevant to this Complaint, acting alone or in concert with
11 others, Abflex has marketed and sold the AB Energizer. Abflex transacts or has transacted
12 business in the Southern District of California.

8. Defendant AB Energizer, L.L.C. ("AE") is a California limited liability company located
at 7975 Raytheon Road, Suite 380, San Diego, California. At all times relevant to this Complaint,
acting alone or in concert with others, AE has marketed and sold the AB Energizer. AE transacts
or has transacted business in the Southern District of California.

9. Defendant Thomas C. Nelson ("Nelson") is a general partner of EPD and the Chief
 Financial Officer of Energizer. At all times relevant to this Complaint, acting alone or in concert
 with others, Nelson has formulated, directed, controlled or participated in the acts and practices of
 EPD, including the various acts and practices set forth herein. He transacts or has transacted
 business in the Southern District of California.

10. Defendant Holly Hernandez, a/k/a Holly Bryan ("Hernandez") is a general partner and
registered agent of EPD. She is also the registered agent for AE. At all times relevant to this
Complaint, acting alone or in concert with others, Hernandez has formulated, directed, controlled
or participated in the acts and practices of EPD, including the various acts and practices set forth
herein. She transacts or has transacted business in the Southern District of California.

27 11. Defendant Martin Van Der Hoeven ("Van Der Hoeven") is the president of Abflex and
28 acts as a "consultant" to AE. At all times relevant to this Complaint, acting alone or in concert

1	with others, Van Der Hoeven has formulated, directed, controlled or participated in the acts and	
2	practices of Abflex and AE, including the various acts and practices set forth herein. He transacts	
3	or has transacted business in the Southern District of California.	
4	12. The foregoing Defendants have operated as a common enterprise to advertise, promote,	
5	offer for sale, sell or distribute the AB Energizer.	
6		
7	<u>COMMERCE</u>	
8	13. The acts and practices of the Defendants, as alleged herein, have been in or affecting	
9	commerce, as "commerce" is defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.	
10		
11	DEFENDANTS' COURSE OF CONDUCT	
12	14. Since at least the fall of 2001, and continuing thereafter, Defendants EPD, Energizer,	
13	Abflex, AE, Nelson, Hernandez and Van Der Hoeven (collectively, the "Defendants") have	
14	advertised and sold the AB Energizer nationwide through, but not necessarily limited to, program-	
15	length television infomercials, short television commercials, an Internet website,	
16	www.abenergizer.com, and product packaging. Transcripts or facsimiles of these materials are	
17	annexed hereto as Exhibits 1 though 6.	
18	15. The Defendants have offered the AB Energizer for \$59.95, plus shipping and handling,	
19	directly to consumers through a toll-free telephone number and the Defendants' Internet website.	
20	Additionally, the AB Energizer has been available in retail outlets such as Modell's Sporting	
21	Goods, Target, and The Sports Authority. Along with the AB Energizer, consumers have received	
22	a user's manual (which includes a weight loss guide), an instructional video, a water-based gel, and	
23	a carrying bag. As a bonus, consumers have received a thirty-day supply of "Diet Energizer," a	
24	dietary supplement containing botanical equivalents to ephedrine, caffeine, and aspirin - ingredients	
25	commonly promoted as weight loss agents.	
26	16. The AB Energizer is an electronic muscle stimulation device. To use the AB Energizer,	
27	consumers attach two or four small electrodes (battery-operated powered units) to a belt, apply the	
28	water-based gel to both the section of the belt that holds the electrodes and to the targeted muscles,	

put the belt on, and push a button. According to the Defendants, the AB Energizer delivers gentle
 electronic impulses to targeted muscles. The targeted muscles purportedly react to the impulses by
 contracting and relaxing involuntarily, in a manner that the Defendants claim is similar to the
 contractions associated with abdominal exercises such as sit-ups and crunches.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

Defendants' advertisements and claims for the AB Energizer

17. The Defendants have disseminated or caused to be disseminated a 30-minute infomercial that has appeared more than 1650 times between October 2001 and February 22, 2002 on about 35 national cable stations. The AB Energizer infomercial has often been among the ten most frequently aired infomercials, and the Defendants spent more than eight million dollars (\$8,000,000) to broadcast the AB Energizer infomercial between October 2001 and January 2002 alone.

13 18. The infomercial features two hosts. The first, John McCafferty, pretends to be 14 unfamiliar with the AB Energizer and skeptical of its effectiveness. The second, Kita Pelly, is 15 presented as a "nationally recognized fitness expert" who, through the course of the infomercial, 16 attempts to prove to John McCafferty that the AB Energizer can safely provide "rock-hard abs." 17 By the end of the infomercial, skeptic co-host John McCafferty is convinced that the AB Energizer is a safe and effective substitute for abdominal exercise and that it causes "rock-hard abs" and 18 19 weight loss. The infomercial also includes: (1) user testimonials, (2) scientific-looking images that 20 purport to illustrate how the AB Energizer functions, (3) commentary by Dr. Michael Skyhar, an 21 orthopedic surgeon, and (4) male and female models with exceptional abdominal definition dressed 22 in bikinis and tight-fitting workout clothes. Ex. 1, AB Energizer infomercial videotape; Ex. 2, AB 23 Energizer infomercial transcript.

19. The Defendants also have disseminated or caused to be disseminated a one-minute
television commercial ("short spot") that encapsulates the primary messages of the 30-minute
infomercial. The short spot includes over ten images of models with exceptional abdominal
definition dressed in bikinis and workout clothes. Ex. 3, short spot videotape; Ex. 4, short spot
transcript.

20. The advertisements and promotional materials for the AB Energizer discussed in Paragraphs 14 and 17 to 19 ("AB Energizer Promotional Materials") convey four core messages about the efficacy, performance, and safety of the AB Energizer: (1) the AB Energizer causes loss of weight, inches, and fat; (2) causes well-defined abdominal muscles (e.g., "go from flab to rockhard abs," "get the tight abs you've been dreaming about," and develop the "six-pack abs you've been dreaming about."); (3) use of the AB Energizer is equivalent to abdominal exercises such as sit-ups and crunches; and (4) the AB Energizer is safe for all users.

(1) Loss of weight, inches and fat claims

21. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not necessarily limited to, the following statements and depictions about how the AB Energizer causes loss of weight, inches, and fat:

a. KITA PELLY: "The AB Energizer System is absolutely incredible for people who want tighter abs and want to lose inches around the midsection." Ex. 2 at 29-30.

b. KITA PELLY: "[I]t works not only your abs, but it also tightens and firms your love handles, your lower back, your thighs and your buns, too... The AB Energizer gives you firm, toned abs without even breaking a sweat." Ex. 2 at 38.

c. JOHN McCAFFERTY: "So, I work my stomach muscles without breaking a sweat and get rid of that gut once and for all?"

KITA PELLY: "It's worked for thousands of men and women and I don't see any reason why it won't work for you." Ex. 2 at 56-57.

d. UNIDENTIFIED MALE USER: "I've lost 40 pounds. I've gone from a waist
37 to a waist 34. The AB Energizer and the AB Energizer System has [sic] changed my life
and it's really given my life back to me." Ex. 2 at 31. See also id. at 40, 51, 60; Ex. 4 at 74.

ON SCREEN IMAGE/TEXT: Shortly before this statement, the viewer is shown a "before" picture of the visibly overweight user, with the words "**Before 225 lbs**." in large, bold letters to his left. During the statement, the screen is split into two images, adding a leaner "after" photograph to contrast with the bulky "before" photograph. The words:

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

25

26

27

28

б

1	
1	"Lost 40 lbs., size 37 to 34" appear in large yellow and white letters between the before and
2	after photographs.
3	At the same time, at the bottom of the screen in small print approximately one tenth
4	the size of the weight loss claim, in poorly contrasting lettering, appear the words: "Results
5	not typical. Individual results may vary."
6	e. UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE USER: "My body already feels tighter. I've lost
7	three pounds." Ex.2 at 33.
8	f. UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE USER: "I've lost just under 10 pounds in 2 and a
9	half weeks." Ex. 2 at 33.
10	ON SCREEN IMAGE/TEXT: The viewer is shown a "before" photograph of the
11	user, and the words "Lost 10 Lbs." flash across the top of the screen in large, bold yellow
12	letters. The screen then splits into "before" and "after" images, in which the user appears
13	much thinner in the "after" picture. [Same message and display characteristics described in
14	Paragraph 22(d) appear at Ex. 2 at 33.]
15	g. UNIDENTIFIED MALE USER: "I've lost 12 pounds and 3 inches off my waist
16	in 4 weeks." Ex. 2 at 33.
17	ON SCREEN IMAGE/TEXT: The words "Lost 12 lbs. 3" off waist!" appear on
18	the screen. [Same message and display characteristics described in Paragraph 22(d) appear
19	at Ex. 2 at 33.]
20	22. Information contained only in the AB Energizer user's manual and website has
21	divulged that the AB Energizer does not burn calories. Exhibit 5(b), AB Energizer website, at 95;
22	Exhibit 7, AB Energizer user's manual, at 114. The user's manual, which consumers receive after
23	they buy the product, has added that the AB Energizer is purportedly a two-part "system," and that
24	under this "system," the AB Energizer itself supposedly contributes to muscle formation, whereas
25	"[t]he rest of the System (the AB Energizer Dietary Supplement and this Weight Loss Guide) will
26	help you achieve your weight loss goals!" Ex. 7 at 113. The user's manual has also stated that the
27	AB Energizer "does not claim to burn fat away" and "does not substitute for cardio-vascular
28	exercise." Ex. 7 at 114, 133.

(2) Well-defined abdominal muscles claims

2	23. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not necessarily limited
3	to, the following statements and depictions about how the AB Energizer causes well-defined
4	abdominal muscles (e.g., "go from flab to rock-hard abs," "get the tight abs you've been dreaming
5	about," and develop the "six-pack abs you've been dreaming about."):
6	a. VOICE-OVER (four times): "With a touch of a button, you can go from flab to
7	rock-hard abs." Ex. 2 at 22, 39, 50, 62.
8	ON SCREEN IMAGE: A flabby, overweight male torso transforms ("morphs") into
9	a slender male torso with "six-pack" abdominal muscles. Both subjects are wearing the
10	same bathing trunks, but their faces are never shown.
11	b. VOICE-OVER (four times): "Introducing the revolutionary AB Energizer
12	System, featuring 21st century scientific technology that gives you a simple, effective, easy
13	way to get firm, toned abs without breaking a sweat." Ex. 2 at 23, 39, 50-51, 62.
14	ON SCREEN IMAGE/TEXT: One male and one female torso, both with well-
15	defined muscles, wearing the AB Energizer, followed by an array of sculpted torsos in
16	bathing suits. At the same time, the words "Simple & Easy," "Firm Tone Abs," and "No
17	Sweat" flash onto the screen.
18	c. VOICE-OVER: "Now you can get the tight abs you've been dreaming about
19	without breaking a sweat with the AB Energizer." Ex. 2 at 25.
20	d. KITA PELLY: "Poor muscle tone allows your waistline to drift down and droop
21	into the pelvic girdle. The end result is your stomach droops even though you're not really
22	that heavy. The answer is easy. The AB Energizer's electronic impulses stimulate your abs
23	so they contract and relax as if you're doing a sit-up. So, it firms and tones your lower
24	abdominals." Ex. 2 at 56.
25	ON SCREEN IMAGE: A scientific-looking green-lined graphic on a black
26	background depicts the profile of a human torso. The "drooping stomach" area is depicted
27	as a plump yellow slab placed within the green lines of the torso, and there are two AB
28	

1	Energizer electrodes placed near the yellow slab. As Ms. Pelly speaks, the torso contracts,	
2	and the yellow slab quickly shrinks.	
3	e. KITA PELLY: "So, why not get the six-pack abs you've been dreaming about?	
4	You can do it sooner than you think with the AB Energizer." Ex. 2 at 67.	
5	f. The box cover has included three photographs of people wearing the AB	
6	Energizer on various body parts, with the phrases "Tighter Abs," "Firmer Buttocks," and	
7	"Sculpted Thighs." The subjects in all three photographs have well-defined muscles.	
8	Exhibit 6, AB Energizer package cover, at 106, 107.	
9	24. Throughout the infomercial and short spot, when speakers discuss the AB Energizer,	
10	there have been images of men and women with sculpted, well-defined and developed abdominal	
11	muscles. Exs. 1 and 3.	
12		
13	(3) Equivalent to abdominal exercise claims	
14	25. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not necessarily limited	
15	to, the following statements and depictions about how use of the AB Energizer is equivalent to	
16	abdominal exercises such as sit-ups and crunches:	
17	a. VOICE-OVER: "[S]timulate your abs so they contract and relax as if you're	
18	doing a sit-up. Now you can get 700 muscle exercising contractions in just 10 minutes and	
19	get abs with the tone and definition you've always dreamed of." Ex. 2 at 23-24, 39-40, 51,	
20	62-63, Ex. 4 at 73.	
21	ON SCREEN TEXT: "Stimulate abs," "up to 700 muscle contractions," and "10	
22	minutes."	
23	b. KITA PELLY: "Many people think that sit-ups and crunches are the only	
24	answer. Well, I recommend the Ab Energizer." Ex. 2 at 25.	
25	c. KITA PELLY: "It's safe, fast, and really gets the results you're after. So, if you	
26	don't want all that pain and hardship while working out in a sweaty gym on those machines,	
27	or you can't afford a gym membership, or you just plain don't want to stand in those long	
28	lines, get the AB Energizer and you'll be on your way to fitter, tighter abs." Ex. 2 at 48.	
	9	

1	d. KITA PELLY: "So, if you've been looking for a great way to get firm, toned	
2	abs, waist, hips and thighs, now's your chance, because the AB Energizer does the thinking	
3	and workout for you. You don't have to sweat, you don't have to do sit-ups or use any	
4	more ab machines on the floor. It's as easy as putting on a belt and pushing a button." Ex.	
5	2 at 49-50.	
6	e. KITA PELLY: "Well, that's the beauty of 21 st century scientific technology	
7	perfected. The AB Energizer's programmable electronic impulses stimulate your abs so	
8	they contract and then relax, just as if you're doing a sit-up or working out on an ab	
9	machine. So, your muscles are programmed to think that they're exercising the old-	
10	fashioned way on the floor and sweating." Ex. 2 at 59-60.	
11		
12	(4) <u>Safety claims</u>	
13	26. The pre-sale AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not	
14	necessarily limited to, the following statements and depictions that the AB Energizer is safe for all	
15	users:	
15 16	users: a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle	
16	a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle	
16 17	a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle stimulation, provides a safe way to strengthen any muscle and increase that muscle's mass."	
16 17 18	a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle stimulation, provides a safe way to strengthen any muscle and increase that muscle's mass." Ex. 2 at 29.	
16 17 18 19	 a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle stimulation, provides a safe way to strengthen any muscle and increase that muscle's mass." Ex. 2 at 29. b. KITA PELLY: "[J]ust about anybody can use the AB Energizer." Ex. 2 at 36. 	
16 17 18 19 20	 a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle stimulation, provides a safe way to strengthen any muscle and increase that muscle's mass." Ex. 2 at 29. b. KITA PELLY: "[J]ust about anybody can use the AB Energizer." Ex. 2 at 36. ON SCREEN TEXT: In small, white, poorly contrasting letters at the bottom: 	
16 17 18 19 20 21	 a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle stimulation, provides a safe way to strengthen any muscle and increase that muscle's mass." Ex. 2 at 29. b. KITA PELLY: "[J]ust about anybody can use the AB Energizer." Ex. 2 at 36. ON SCREEN TEXT: In small, white, poorly contrasting letters at the bottom: "Consult your doctor or medical professional before starting any exercise program." 	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle stimulation, provides a safe way to strengthen any muscle and increase that muscle's mass." Ex. 2 at 29. b. KITA PELLY: "[J]ust about anybody can use the AB Energizer." Ex. 2 at 36. ON SCREEN TEXT: In small, white, poorly contrasting letters at the bottom: "Consult your doctor or medical professional before starting any exercise program." c. The AB Energizer website has included a photograph of Dr. Skyhar, under the 	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	 a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle stimulation, provides a safe way to strengthen any muscle and increase that muscle's mass." Ex. 2 at 29. b. KITA PELLY: "[J]ust about anybody can use the AB Energizer." Ex. 2 at 36. ON SCREEN TEXT: In small, white, poorly contrasting letters at the bottom: "Consult your doctor or medical professional before starting any exercise program." c. The AB Energizer website has included a photograph of Dr. Skyhar, under the banner "What Experts Say," along with his statement recommending the AB Energizer 	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	 a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle stimulation, provides a safe way to strengthen any muscle and increase that muscle's mass." Ex. 2 at 29. b. KITA PELLY: "[J]ust about anybody can use the AB Energizer." Ex. 2 at 36. ON SCREEN TEXT: In small, white, poorly contrasting letters at the bottom: "Consult your doctor or medical professional before starting any exercise program." c. The AB Energizer website has included a photograph of Dr. Skyhar, under the banner "What Experts Say," along with his statement recommending the AB Energizer because it is "safe, comfortable, simple and effective." Ex. 5(a) at 78. 	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	 a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle stimulation, provides a safe way to strengthen any muscle and increase that muscle's mass." Ex. 2 at 29. b. KITA PELLY: "[J]ust about anybody can use the AB Energizer." Ex. 2 at 36. ON SCREEN TEXT: In small, white, poorly contrasting letters at the bottom: "Consult your doctor or medical professional before starting any exercise program." c. The AB Energizer website has included a photograph of Dr. Skyhar, under the banner "What Experts Say," along with his statement recommending the AB Energizer because it is "safe, comfortable, simple and effective." Ex. 5(a) at 78. d. The Frequently Asked Questions section of the website has asked if the AB 	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	 a. DR. MICHAEL SKYHAR: "[T]he AB Energizer with its electrical muscle stimulation, provides a safe way to strengthen any muscle and increase that muscle's mass." Ex. 2 at 29. b. KITA PELLY: "[J]ust about anybody can use the AB Energizer." Ex. 2 at 36. ON SCREEN TEXT: In small, white, poorly contrasting letters at the bottom: "Consult your doctor or medical professional before starting any exercise program." c. The AB Energizer website has included a photograph of Dr. Skyhar, under the banner "What Experts Say," along with his statement recommending the AB Energizer because it is "safe, comfortable, simple and effective." Ex. 5(a) at 78. d. The Frequently Asked Questions section of the website has asked if the AB Energizer is safe and answered: "The AB Energizer is a safe, effective way to stimulate, 	

1	used by doctors and permitted by the Olympic Medal Advisory Committee for many years.	
2	<u>Id.</u>	
3	e. The Dr. Skyhar photograph and statement in Paragraph 26(c) has also appeared	
4	on the package cover. Ex. 6 at 108.	
5	27. Although the AB Energizer promotional materials state that the device is safe, the AB	
б	Energizer user's manual has warned that the AB Energizer should not be used by people with	
7	cancer, or by anyone who has a cardiac pacemaker. In addition, they warn that users should seek	
8	advice from their doctor before using the machine if they have, inter alia:	
9	 Phlebitis in its active phase (inflammation of a vein); Tissue inflamation from disease or injury (e.g. nervous tissue disorder); Varicose veins in its later stages; 	
10		
11	 Cancerous lesions. 	
12	Ex. 7 at 130. This information has not appeared in any of the television advertisements, and was	
13	included on the website only in about April 2002.	
14		
15	Refund and delivery practices	
15 16	Refund and delivery practices 28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches	
16	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches	
16 17	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches off their waists in the first 30 days. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but	
16 17 18	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches off their waists in the first 30 days. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not limited to, the following statement: "The AB Energizer system is guaranteed. If you don't	
16 17 18 19	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches off their waists in the first 30 days. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not limited to, the following statement: "The AB Energizer system is guaranteed. If you don't lose at least two inches off your waist in the first 30 days, return it for a full refund of the purchase	
16 17 18 19 20	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches off their waists in the first 30 days. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not limited to, the following statement: "The AB Energizer system is guaranteed. If you don't lose at least two inches off your waist in the first 30 days, return it for a full refund of the purchase price, no questions asked." Ex. 2 at 44, 55, 67; Ex. 4 at 75. The Defendants have provided a	
16 17 18 19 20 21	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches off their waists in the first 30 days. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not limited to, the following statement: "The AB Energizer system is guaranteed. If you don't lose at least two inches off your waist in the first 30 days, return it for a full refund of the purchase price, no questions asked." Ex. 2 at 44, 55, 67; Ex. 4 at 75. The Defendants have provided a customer service telephone number on the consumers' credit card bill for consumers who wish to	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches off their waists in the first 30 days. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not limited to, the following statement: "The AB Energizer system is guaranteed. If you don't lose at least two inches off your waist in the first 30 days, return it for a full refund of the purchase price, no questions asked." Ex. 2 at 44, 55, 67; Ex. 4 at 75. The Defendants have provided a customer service telephone number on the consumers' credit card bill for consumers who wish to return the product and receive a refund. A recorded phone message on the customer service	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches off their waists in the first 30 days. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not limited to, the following statement: "The AB Energizer system is guaranteed. If you don't lose at least two inches off your waist in the first 30 days, return it for a full refund of the purchase price, no questions asked." Ex. 2 at 44, 55, 67; Ex. 4 at 75. The Defendants have provided a customer service telephone number on the consumers' credit card bill for consumers who wish to return the product and receive a refund. A recorded phone message on the customer service telephone number has provided an email address as another method for consumers who wish to	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches off their waists in the first 30 days. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not limited to, the following statement: "The AB Energizer system is guaranteed. If you don't lose at least two inches off your waist in the first 30 days, return it for a full refund of the purchase price, no questions asked." Ex. 2 at 44, 55, 67; Ex. 4 at 75. The Defendants have provided a customer service telephone number on the consumers' credit card bill for consumers who wish to return the product and receive a refund. A recorded phone message on the customer service telephone number has provided an email address as another method for consumers who wish to return the product and request a refund.	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches off their waists in the first 30 days. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not limited to, the following statement: "The AB Energizer system is guaranteed. If you don't lose at least two inches off your waist in the first 30 days, return it for a full refund of the purchase price, no questions asked." Ex. 2 at 44, 55, 67; Ex. 4 at 75. The Defendants have provided a customer service telephone number on the consumers' credit card bill for consumers who wish to return the product and receive a refund. A recorded phone message on the customer service telephone number has provided an email address as another method for consumers who wish to return the product and request a refund. 29. Numerous consumers who sought refunds were unable to reach an operator at the	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	28. The Defendants have offered a refund to consumers who do not lose at least two inches off their waists in the first 30 days. The AB Energizer Promotional Materials have included, but are not limited to, the following statement: "The AB Energizer system is guaranteed. If you don't lose at least two inches off your waist in the first 30 days, return it for a full refund of the purchase price, no questions asked." Ex. 2 at 44, 55, 67; Ex. 4 at 75. The Defendants have provided a customer service telephone number on the consumers' credit card bill for consumers who wish to return the product and receive a refund. A recorded phone message on the customer service telephone number has provided an email address as another method for consumers who wish to return the product and request a refund. 29. Numerous consumers who sought refunds were unable to reach an operator at the Defendants' customer service phone number, even after waiting on hold for long periods.	

30. The AB Energizer website has stated that the product will be delivered in approximately four to six weeks or four to eight weeks. Ex 5(a) at 81-82, 5(b) at 90-91. Similarly, 3 the Defendants have told customers who ordered the product by telephone that the product will 4 arrive within four to six weeks.

31. On numerous occasions, the Defendants failed to ship the product for delivery within four to six weeks or four to eight weeks, and in some instances, consumers never received the product.

8 9

1

2

5

6

7

DEFENDANTS' VIOLATIONS OF THE FTC ACT

32. Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), prohibits unfair or deceptive acts or 10 11 practices in or affecting commerce. Section 12(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 52(a), prohibits the 12 dissemination of any false advertisement in or affecting commerce for the purpose of inducing, or which is likely to induce, the purchase of food, drugs, devices, services, or cosmetics. For the 13 14 purposes of Section 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 52, the AB Energizer is a "device" pursuant to Section 15(d) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 55(d). As set forth below, the Defendants have engaged 15 16 and are continuing to engage in such unlawful practices in connection with the marketing and sale 17 of the AB Energizer.

19 20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

18

COUNT ONE FALSE LOSS OF WEIGHT, INCHES, AND FAT CLAIMS

33. Through the means described in Paragraphs 14 and 17 through 21, the Defendants have represented, expressly or by implication, that the AB Energizer causes loss of weight, inches, and fat.

34. In truth and in fact, the AB Energizer does not cause loss of weight, inches, and fat. Therefore, the making of the representations set forth in Paragraph 33 constitutes a deceptive practice, and the making of false advertisements, in or affecting commerce, in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 52.

1 2 **COUNT TWO** WELL-DEFINED ABDOMINAL MUSCLES CLAIMS 3 35. Through the means described in Paragraphs 14, 17 through 20, and 23 through 24, the 4 Defendants have represented, expressly or by implication, that the AB Energizer causes well-defined 5 abdominal muscles (e.g., "go from flab to rock-hard abs," "get the tight abs you've been dreaming 6 about," and develop the "six-pack abs you've been dreaming about."). 7 36. In truth and in fact, the AB Energizer does not cause well-defined abdominal muscles 8 (e.g., "go from flab to rock-hard abs," "get the tight abs you've been dreaming about," and develop 9 the "six-pack abs you've been dreaming about."). Therefore, the making of the representations set 10 forth in Paragraph 35 constitutes a deceptive practice, and the making of false advertisements, in or 11 affecting commerce, in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 52. 12 13 COUNT THREE 14 FALSE EQUIVALENT TO EXERCISE CLAIMS 37. Through the means described in Paragraphs 14, 17 through 20, and 25, the Defendants 15 16 have represented, expressly or by implication, that use of the AB Energizer is equivalent to 17 performing abdominal exercises such as sit-ups and crunches. 18 38. In truth and in fact, use of the AB Energizer is not equivalent to performing abdominal exercises such as sit-ups and crunches. Therefore, the making of the representations set forth in 19 20 Paragraph 37 constitutes a deceptive practice, and the making of false advertisements, in or 21 affecting commerce, in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 22 52. 23 24 COUNT FOUR FAILURE TO DISCLOSE SAFETY RISKS 25 39. Through the means described in Paragraphs 14, 17 through 20, and 26, the Defendants 26 have represented, expressly or by implication, that the AB Energizer is safe for all users. In 27 connection with repeated references to safety, the Defendants have failed to disclose or to disclose 28

adequately that the AB Energizer is not safe for all users. In fact, the AB Energizer should not be 1 2 used by people with implanted cardiac pacemakers; it poses health risks for use over or near 3 cancerous lesions, and swollen, infected or inflamed areas or skin eruptions, e.g., phlebitis, thrombophlebitis, varicose veins; and the AB Energizer's safety has not been established for 4 5 pregnant women. These facts would be material to consumers in their purchase of the AB 6 Energizer.

40. In light of the representations made in Paragraph 26, the Defendants' failure to disclose the material information in Paragraph 39 about health risks was, and is, a deceptive practice, and constitutes false advertising of a device, in or affecting commerce, in violation of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 52. 10

COUNT FIVE FAILURE TO HONOR MONEY BACK GUARANTEE

41. Through the means described in Paragraphs 14, 17 through 20, and 28, the Defendants have represented, expressly or by implication, that they will provide timely refunds to consumers who do not lose two inches off their waists within 30 days, no questions asked.

42. In truth and in fact, in many instances, the Defendants did not provide timely refunds to consumers who did not lose two inches off their waists within 30 days, no questions asked. Therefore, the making of the representations set forth in Paragraph 41 constitutes a deceptive practice, in or affecting commerce, in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

COUNT SIX VIOLATION OF THE MAIL ORDER RULE

43. The Rule Concerning Mail or Telephone Order Merchandise ("Mail Order Rule") was 23 promulgated by the FTC on October 22, 1975, under the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 41 et seq. On 24 25 September 21, 1993, the Mail Order Rule was amended under Section 18 of the FTC Act, 15 26 U.S.C. § 57a, and the amendments took effect March 1, 1994. The Mail Order Rule applies to orders placed by mail, telephone, facsimile transmission or on the Internet.

27 28

7

8

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

44. At all times material hereto, the Defendants have engaged in the sale of merchandise
 ordered by mail, telephone or the Internet, in commerce.

45. In numerous instances, after having solicited orders for merchandise and received
"properly completed orders," as that term is defined in Section 435.2(d) of the Mail Order Rule, 16
C.F.R. § 435.2(d), and having been unable to ship the merchandise to the buyer within the Mail
Order Rule's applicable time, as set forth in Section 435.1(a)(1) of the Mail Order Rule
("applicable time"), 16 C.F.R. § 435.1(a)(1), the Defendants:

a. Violated Section 435.1(b)(1) of the Mail Order Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 435.1(b)(1), by failing, within the applicable time, to offer to the buyer, clearly and conspicuously and without prior demand, an option either to consent to the delay in shipping or to cancel the order and receive a prompt refund; and

b. Having failed within the applicable time to ship the merchandise or to offer the buyer the option to either consent to a delay or to cancel the buyer's order and receive a prompt refund, violated Section 435.1(c)(5) of the Mail Order Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 435.1(c)(5), by failing to deem the order canceled and to make a prompt refund to the buyer, as "prompt refund" is defined in Section 435.2(f) of the Rule, 16 C.F.R. § 435.2(f).
46. Pursuant to Section 18(d)(3) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 57a(d)(3), violations of the Mail Order Rule constitute unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce, in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

CONSUMER INJURY

47. Consumers throughout the United States have suffered and continue to suffer substantial monetary loss and may suffer physical injury as a result of the Defendants' unlawful acts and practices. In addition, the Defendants also have been unjustly enriched as a result of their unlawful practices. Absent injunctive relief by this Court, the Defendants are likely to continue to injure consumers, reap unjust enrichment, and harm the public interest.

2.4

THIS COURT'S POWER TO GRANT RELIEF

48. Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), empowers this Court to grant injunctive and such other relief as the Court may deem appropriate to halt and redress violations of the FTC Act. The Court, in the exercise of its equitable jurisdiction, may award other ancillary relief, including consumer redress, disgorgement, and restitution, to prevent and remedy injury caused by the Defendants' law violations.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff FTC, pursuant to Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), and the Court's own equitable powers, requests that this Court:

Permanently enjoin the Defendants from violating Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act
 and the Mail Order Rule, as alleged herein, including committing such violations in connection
 with the advertising or sale of food, drugs, dietary supplements, devices, cosmetics, or other
 products, services or programs,

2. Award the Plaintiff all temporary and preliminary injunctive and ancillary relief that may be necessary to avert the likelihood of consumer injury during the pendency of this action, and to preserve the possibility of effective and final relief, including, but not limited to, temporary and preliminary injunctions and an accounting;

3. Award such equitable relief as the Court finds necessary to redress injury to consumers
resulting from the Defendants' violations of Sections 5(a) and 12 of the FTC Act and the Mail
Order Rule, including, but not limited to, rescission of contracts and restitution, other forms of
redress, and the disgorgement of ill-gotten gains; and

4. Award the Plaintiff the costs of bringing this action, and such other equitable relief as theCourt may determine to be just and proper.

1		
2	Dated:	Respectfully submitted,
3		
4 5		WILLIAM E. KOVACIC General Counsel
6		ELAINE D. KOLISH Associate Director for Enforcement
7		JONI LUPOVITZ Assistant Director for Enforcement
8		
9		
10		JOHN D. JACOBS
11		Cal. Bar No. 134154 10877 Wilshire Boulevard
12		Suite 700 Los Angeles, California 90024
13		(310) 824-4360 (310) 824-4380 - fax
14		(510) 021 1500 144
15		ROBERT SUSSMAN WALTER GROSS III
16		AMY LLOYD Attorneys for the Plaintiff
17		Division of Enforcement Bureau of Consumer Protection
18		Federal Trade Commission Washington, D.C. 20580
19		(202) 326-2747 - RS (202) 326-3319 - WG
20		(202) 326-2559 (fax)
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		