UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS

Civil Action No.

2

1

3

4

5

6

7 8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19 20

21

2.2 23

24

25

26

27

28

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff,

v.

ONESOURCE WORLDWIDE NETWORK, INC., a corporation, JAMES MICHAEL FOBAIR, individually and as an officer of OneSource Worldwide Network, Inc., Defendants.

STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT

WHEREAS: Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or the "Commission") commenced this action by filing the Complaint herein; Defendants have waived service of the Summons and Complaint; the parties have been represented by the attorneys whose names appear hereafter; and the parties have agreed to the settlement of this action upon the following terms and conditions, without adjudication of any issue of fact or law and without Defendants admitting liability for any of the matters alleged in the Complaint;

THEREFORE, on the joint motion of Plaintiff and Defendants, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED, and DECREED as follows:

FINDINGS

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction of the subject matter and of the parties;
- The Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against OneSource Worldwide Network, Inc. ("OWN") and James

- 3. Venue is proper as to all parties in the Northern District of Texas;
- 4. The activities of OWN and Fobair are in or affecting commerce, as defined in the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44; and
- 5. OWN and Fobair have waived all rights that may arise under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, amended by Pub. L. 104-121, 110 Stat. 847, 863-64 (1996).

DEFINITIONS

- 6. "Defendants" means OWN and Fobair, their successors and assigns, and their officers, agents, servants and employees, and all persons in active concert or participation with any one or more of them who receive actual notice of this Stipulated Final Judgment ("Judgment") by personal service or otherwise.
- 7. "Competent and reliable scientific evidence" means tests, analyses, research, studies, or other evidence based on the expertise of professionals in the relevant area, that has been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by persons qualified to do so, using procedures generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results.
- 8. "Laundry product" means any product used in the process of refurbishing textiles, including but not limited to products described as replacing detergents or bleaches, whether referred to as "boosters" or "brighteners," and products described as changing the nature of water by any means that will have a beneficial effect on washing, including water filters, water filtration systems,

2.2

water purification systems, or water cleaning systems.

9. "Consumer" means a purchaser (including purchasers for resale) of one or more products sold by Defendants, whether or not purchased directly from Defendants.

ORDER

I. PROHIBITED CLAIMS FOR CERTAIN PRODUCTS

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, distributor, or other device, in connection with the advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of The EarthSmart Laundry CD ("Laundry CD"), or any substantially similar product, in or affecting commerce, are hereby permanently enjoined from representing in any manner, expressly or by implication that:

- A. such product cleans laundry as well as conventional laundry detergents;
- B. such product cleans laundry by changing the molecular structure of water;
- C. scientific tests prove that such product cleans laundry as well as conventional laundry detergents;

II. CLAIMS REQUIRED TO BE TRUE AND SUBSTANTIATED

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, distributor, or other device, in connection with the advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any product, in or affecting commerce, are hereby enjoined from making any representation in any manner, expressly or by implication:

A. that such product softens fabrics as well as STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT, p. 3 of 19

conventional fabric softeners;

- B. that such product is 100% recyclable.
- C. regarding such product's comparative or absolute efficacy, benefits, mechanism of action, or performance; unless the representation is true and, at the time it is made, Defendants possess and rely upon competent and reliable evidence, which when appropriate must be competent and reliable scientific evidence, that substantiates the representation.

III. CLAIMS ABOUT TESTS, STUDIES OR RESEARCH

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, distributor, or other device, in connection with the advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any product, in or affecting commerce, are hereby enjoined from misrepresenting, in any manner, expressly or by implication, the existence, contents, validity, results, conclusions, or interpretations of any test, study, or research.

IV. CLAIMS MADE THROUGH TESTIMONIALS AND/OR ENDORSEMENTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, distributor, or other device, in connection with the advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any product, in or affecting commerce, are hereby enjoined from representing in any manner, expressly or by implication, that the experience represented by any user testimonial or endorsement of such product represents the typical or ordinary experience of members of the public who use the product, unless:

A. The representation is true and, at the time it is STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT, p. 4 of 19

- B. Defendants disclose clearly and prominently, and in close proximity to the endorsement or testimonial, either:
- (1) what the generally expected results would be for users of the product, or
- (2) the limited applicability of the endorser's experience to what consumers may generally expect to achieve, that is, that consumers should not expect to experience similar results. For purposes of this Paragraph, "endorsement" shall mean as defined in 16 C.F.R. § 255.0(b).

V. ENVIRONMENTAL CLAIMS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT Defendants, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, distributor, or other device, in connection with the advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any product, in or affecting commerce, are hereby enjoined from making any representation, in any manner, expressly or by implication:

- A. that using such product will make rivers, streams, oceans, or other water sources, safer and cleaner by reducing the use of detergents and soaps; or
- B. regarding such product's environmental benefits; unless, at the time the representation is made, Defendants possess and rely upon competent and reliable evidence, which when appropriate must be competent and reliable scientific evidence, that substantiates the representation.

2.2

VI. PROHIBITED DISTRIBUTION OF CONSUMER INFORMATION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT Defendants are hereby enjoined from offering for sale, selling, or distributing to any person other than to a named defendant, an entity in which a named defendant is an owner, or a law enforcement agency, any list of any consumer's name, telephone number, mailing address, bank or credit card account number, or other identifying information.

VII. PROHIBITED ACTIVITIES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT Defendants are hereby enjoined from providing knowing substantial assistance to others to engage in any of the activities prohibited by Paragraphs I through VI of this Judgment.

VIII. MONETARY JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT a judgment in the amount of SEVEN AND ONE HALF MILLION DOLLARS (\$7,500,000) is hereby entered against OWN and Fobair, and their successors and assigns. Based on the sworn representations of OWN and Fobair in their financial disclosure statements dated August 21, 1998 and the attachments thereto, hereinafter together designated "Financial Disclosure Statements," payment of the foregoing monetary judgment is waived except for SEVEN THOUSAND ONE HUNDRED AND FORTY-TWO DOLLARS WITH EIGHTY-SIX CENTS (\$7,142.86), contingent upon the accuracy and completeness of the Financial Disclosure Statements. OWN and Fobair are jointly and severally responsible for paying the monetary judgment.

OWN and Fobair shall make the required payment by certified or cashier's check to Plaintiff by April 30, 1999 or the date of entry

STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT, p. 6 of 19

of this Judgment, whichever is later. In the event of any default in payment, which default continues for ten (10) days beyond the due date of payment, the entire unpaid judgment, together with interest, as computed pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1961, from the date of default to the date of payment, shall immediately become due and payable.

Plaintiff's agreement to this monetary judgment is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of the financial condition of Defendants OWN and Fobair, as represented in the Financial Disclosure Statements referenced above, which contain material information upon which the Plaintiff relief in negotiating and agreeing to the waiver of all but \$7,142.86 of the \$7,500,000 monetary judgment. In all other respects, this Judgment shall remain in full force and effect unless otherwise ordered by this Court.

If, upon motion by the Commission, this Court finds that OWN and/or Fobair made any material misrepresentation in or omission from the Financial Disclosure Statements, the entire remaining amount of the SEVEN AND ONE HALF MILLION DOLLARS (\$7,500,000) suspended judgment entered against OWN and Fobair will be immediately due and payable. In connection with any such motion, the only issue shall be whether the financial information OWN and Fobair provided in the Financial Disclosure Statements was fraudulent, misleading, inaccurate or incomplete in any material respect.

The Commission may apply any or all funds received from OWN and Fobair pursuant to this monetary judgment, and any interest

received thereon, to a consumer redress program and to related administrative expenses; provided, however, that if the Commission in its sole discretion determines that a consumer redress program is not feasible, the Commission may pay such funds to the United States Treasury as disgorgement. OWN and Fobair shall have no right to contest the manner of distribution chosen by the Commission.

OWN and Fobair are hereby required, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701, to furnish to the Commission their taxpayer identifying numbers (social security number or employer identification number), which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of their relationship with the government.

For purposes of this Paragraph, and any subsequent proceedings in this cause, OWN and Fobair waive any right to contest any of the allegations of Plaintiff's Complaint.

IX. ALLEGATIONS IN THE COMPLAINT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT the facts as alleged in the Complaint filed with this Judgment shall be taken as true solely for the purpose of any subsequent litigation filed by the FTC to enforce its rights under this Judgment, including its claim for monetary relief, including but not limited to a nondischargeability complaint in any subsequent bankruptcy proceeding.

X. PRODUCTION OF SALES RECORDS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT within 30 days after the entering of this Judgment, Defendants OWN and Fobair, their successors and assigns, shall provide to the FTC a description of the available

records regarding their sales of the Laundry CD from January 1, 1996 to the date of entry of this Judgment, in order for the FTC to design a redress plan. OWN and Fobair shall assist the FTC, and its agents, in locating and producing all records necessary to conduct the proposed claims procedure, including, but not limited to, records identifying the names, addresses, and telephone numbers of consumers who paid for goods from January 1, 1996, the amount the consumer paid, and the amount of any price reduction negotiated by the consumer.

XI. ORDER DISTRIBUTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT, for a period of 3 years from the date of entry of this Judgment, Defendants shall:

- A. Provide a copy of this Judgment to, and obtain a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of same from, each officer or director, each individual serving in a management capacity, all personnel involved in responding to consumer complaints or inquiries, and all sales personnel, whether designated as employees, consultants, independent contractors or otherwise, immediately upon employing or retaining any such persons, for any business where:
- Any of Defendants is the majority owner of the business or directly or indirectly manages or controls the business, and
- 2. the business is engaged in the marketing of laundry or cleaning products or assisting others engaged in such activities; and
 - B. Maintain for a period of 3 years after creation, and STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT, p. 9 of 19

upon reasonable notice, make available to representatives of the Commission, the original signed and dated acknowledgments of the receipt of copies of this Order, as required in Subsection A of 3 4 this Paragraph. 5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

RECORDKEEPING XII.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT for a period of 3 years from the date of entry of this Judgment, OWN and Fobair shall create and maintain:

- Records sufficient to demonstrate compliance with the provisions of this Judgment, including but not limited to:
- (1)All advertisements and promotional materials for any laundry or cleaning products offered for sale by Defendants;
- All materials that were relied upon in (2) disseminating any representation covered by this Judgment; and
- (3) All tests, reports, studies, surveys, demonstrations, or other evidence in their possession or control that contradict, qualify, or call into question any representation covered by this Judgment, or the basis relied upon for the representation, including complaints and other communications with consumers or with governmental or consumer protection organizations;
- В. Records containing the name, address, and telephone number of each consumer who purchases products from any of Defendants either directly or through any third party;
- A record of each written consumer complaint (including complaints referred from any third party, such as any

STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT, p. 10 of 19

facility storing documents, of any business where:

STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT, p. 11 of 19

office of the Better Business Bureau or any State Attorney

1

27

the business is engaged in the marketing of laundry or cleaning products or assisting others engaged in such activities.

In providing such access, Defendants shall permit representatives of the Commission to inspect and copy all documents relevant to any matter contained in this Judgment; and shall permit Commission representatives to remove documents relevant to any matter contained in this Judgment for a period not to exceed 5 business days so that the documents may be inspected, inventoried, and copied; and

To interview the officers, directors, and employees, В. including all personnel involved in responding to consumer complaints or inquiries, and all sales personnel, whether designated as employees, consultants, independent contractors or otherwise, of any business to which Subsection A of this Paragraph applies, concerning matters relating to compliance with the terms of this Judgment. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

Provided that, upon application of the Commission and for good cause shown, the Court may enter an ex parte order granting immediate access to Defendants' business premises for the purposes of inspecting and copying all documents relevant to any matter contained in this Judgment.

MONITORING OF DEFENDANT FOBAIR XIV.

27

1

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

- A. Any change in his residential address, occupation, place of business, or place of employment;
- B. Any change in the name, address, type of business, or identity of each company, corporation, partnership, or business owned or controlled directly or indirectly by him;
- C. Any proposed change in any company, corporation, partnership, or business that is owned or controlled, directly or indirectly, by him including, but not limited to, dissolution, assignment, or sale resulting in the emergence of a successor corporation, the creation or dissolution of subsidiaries, or any other change in their business relationship(s) that may affect compliance obligations arising out of this Judgment;
- D. His affiliation with a new business or employment that involves the advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any products, including a description of such business, the business address, and of his interest in and duties in connection with such business or employment;
- E. The formation of any corporation, sole proprietorship, partnership, or independent consulting business or any other business entity that is engaged directly or indirectly in the advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any products, in which he is or is to become an

F. Any termination or suspension of business operations by him, the resumption of business operations, or any termination, suspension or establishment of any type of consulting relationship with any third party relating to the advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or distribution of any products.

XV. NOTIFICATION OF CHANGES IN BUSINESS STRUCTURE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT Defendant OWN, its successors and assigns, shall notify the Associate Director, Division of Enforcement, Bureau of Consumer Protection, Federal Trade Commission, Washington, D.C. 20580, at least 30 days prior to any change in the business of OWN including, but not limited to, merger, incorporation, dissolution, assignment, sale resulting in the emergence of a successor corporation, the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary or parent, or any other change that may affect Defendants' obligations under this Judgment.

XVI. MONITORING COMPLIANCE OF SALES PERSONNEL

IF IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT Defendant Fobair, in connection with any business where (1) Fobair is the majority owner of the business or directly or indirectly manages or controls the business, and (2) the business is engaged in the marketing of laundry or cleaning products or assisting others engaged in such activity, is hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

A. Failing to take reasonable steps sufficient to monitor and ensure that all employees and independent contractors engaged in sales or other customer service functions comply with

2.2

- 1. listening to the oral representations made by persons engaged in sales or other customer service functions;
- 2. establishing a procedure for receiving and responding to consumer complaints; and
- 3. ascertaining the number and nature of consumer complaints regarding transactions in which each employee or independent contractor is involved.

Provided that this Paragraph does not authorize or require

Fobair to take any steps that violate any federal, state, or local laws;

- B. Failing promptly to investigate fully any consumer complaint received by any business to which this Paragraph applies; and
- C. Failing to take corrective action with respect to any sales person whom Fobair determines is not complying with this Order, which may include training, disciplining, and/or terminating such sales person.

XVII. COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT 180 days after the date of entry of this Order, Defendants shall provide a written report to the FTC, sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which Defendants have complied and are complying with this Judgment. This report shall include but not be limited

to:

number;

A. Fobair's then current residence address and telephone

- B. Fobair's then current employment, business addresses and telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of each such employer, and Fobair's title and responsibilities for each employer;
- C. A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Judgment obtained by Defendants pursuant to Paragraph XX; and
- D. A statement describing the manner in which Defendants have complied and are complying with Paragraphs I through VII, XI, XII, and XVI of this Judgment.

Upon written request by a representative of the Commission,

Defendants shall submit additional written reports (under oath, if
requested) and produce documents on 15 days' notice with respect to
any conduct subject to this Judgment.

For the purposes of this Paragraph, "employment" includes the performance of services as an employee, consultant, or independent contractor; and "employers" include any individual or entity for whom Fobair performs services as an employee, consultant, or independent contractor.

For purposes of the compliance reporting required by this Paragraph, the Commission is authorized to communicate in writing directly with Fobair.

XVIII. COMMISSION'S AUTHORITY TO MONITOR COMPLIANCE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT the Commission is authorized to

STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT, p. 16 of 19

STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT, p. 17 of 19

1	Defendants OWN and Fobair, their successors and assigns, by this
2	Judgment, or concerning this Judgment, shall be sent to the
3	following address:
4	Associate Director
5	Division of Enforcement Federal Trade Commission
6	Washington, D.C. 20580
7	XX. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS
8	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT, within 5 business days after
9	receipt by Defendants of this Order as entered by the Court,
LO	Defendant Fobair shall submit to the Commission a truthful sworn
11	statement, in the form shown on Appendix A, that shall acknowledge
12	receipt of this Judgment.
13	XXI. CONTINUING JURISDICTION
L4	IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT this Court shall retain jurisdiction
L5	of this matter for purposes of construction, modification, and
L6	enforcement of this Judgment.
L7	
18	SO ORDERED, this, day of, 1999 in,
L9	Texas.
20	
21	THE HONORABLE
22	UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
23	
24	The parties hereby consent to the terms and conditions set
25	forth above and consent to entry of the Final Judgment without further notice to the parties. Each party to this Judgment hereby
26	agrees to bear its own costs and attorneys fees incurred in connection with this action.
27	
28	STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT. p. 18 of 19

1	
2	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
3	
4	
5	Pablo M. Zylberglait on behalf of himself.
6	
7	
8	
9	Defendant James M. Fobair, Counsel for Plaintiff on behalf of OneSource
10	Federal Trade Commission Worldwide Network, Inc. Washington, DC 20580
11	202-326-3143;3222
12 13	
14	Mark T. Blake, Esq.
15	Counsel for OneSource Worldwide Network, Inc. and
16	James M. Fobair
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	STIPULATED FINAL JUDGMENT, p. 19 of 19

1 APPENDIX A 2 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS 3 4 5 FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, 6 v. 7 Civil Action No. LIFE EXTENSION INTERNATIONAL, INC., a corporation, ONESOURCE WORLDWIDE NETWORK, INC., a corporation, JAMES MICHAEL FOBAIR, 10 individually and as an officer of Life Extension International, Inc., and) 11 OneSource Worldwide Network, Inc., Defendants. 12 13 James Michael Fobair, being duly sworn, hereby states and 14 15 l affirms as follows: 16 1. My name is James Michael Fobair. My current residence 17 address is 18 I am a citizen of the United States and am over the age of 19 eighteen. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this 20 Affidavit. 2. I am a defendant in FTC v. Life Extension International, 21 22 <u>Inc., et al.</u> (United States District Court for the Northern 23 District of Texas), Civil Action No. ______. 3. On ______, I received a copy of the Stipulated Final 24 Judgment, which was signed by the Honorable _____ and entered by the Court on ______. A true and correct copy of 26

27 The Order I received is appended to this

28

///

1	Affidavit.	
2		
3	I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the	
4	United States that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed o)r
5	, at	
6		
7	James Michael Fobair	
8		
9	State of, City of	-
10		
11	Subscribed and sworn to before me this day of, 199	
12		
13		
14	Notary Public	
15	My Commission Expires:	
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
2627		
28		
∠0	2	