1	DEBRA A. VALENTINE			
2	General Counsel			
3	JOHN D. JACOBS, CA Bar No. 134154 TANYA MAYORKAS, CA Bar No. 189090 Federal Fueda Commission			
4				
5				
6	(310) 824-4380 fax Attorneys for Plaintiff			
7	Accorneys for Plaintill			
8	UNITED STATI	ES DISTRICT COURT		
9	CENTRAL DIST	RICT OF CALIFORNIA		
10	WESTERN DIVISION			
11	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,	CV-99-13114-FMC (CWx)		
12	Plaintiff,	STIPULATED FINAL ORDER FOR		
13		PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND OTHER		
14		EQUITABLE RELIEF		
15	WAZZU CORPORATION, et al.,			
16	Defendants.)			

18 Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission ("Commission") filed a 19 Complaint alleging that Wazzu Corporation ("Wazzu"), Jayme Amirie, Kenneth Gharib, and Kirk Waldfogel (collectively, "Named 20 Defendants") had violated Section 5(a) of the Federal Trade 21 22 Commission Act ("FTC Act"), as amended, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a). The 23 parties have agreed to settle this action by entering into this 24 Stipulated Final Order for Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relief ("Order") without trial or adjudication of any 25 26 issue of law or fact and without Named Defendants admitting liability for any of the matters alleged in the Complaint. 27

28

NOW, THEREFORE, on the joint request of the Commission and Named Defendants, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED and DECREED as follows:

FINDINGS

1. This Court has jurisdiction of the subject matter of
7 this case and over each Named Defendant. Venue in the Central
8 District of California is proper.

4

5

9 2. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be
10 granted against the Named Defendants under Sections 5(a)(1) and
11 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a)(1) and 53(b).

12 3. The Commission has the authority under Section 13(b) of 13 the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), to seek the relief it has 14 requested.

15 4. The activities of the Named Defendants charged in the 16 Complaint are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of 17 the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.

18 5. The Named Defendants have waived any and all claims
19 under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, as
20 amended by PL 104-121, 110 Stat. 847, 863-64 (1996).

Entry of this Order resolves all matters of dispute
 between the Commission and the Named Defendants arising from the
 Complaint in this action, up to the date of entry of this Order.

7. The parties waive all rights to seek appellate review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order. The Named Defendants further waive and release any claim they may have against the Commission, its employees, agents, or representatives arising from any event that occurred up to entry of this Order.

This Order is for settlement purposes only and does not 1 8. constitute and shall not be interpreted to constitute an admission 2 by Named Defendants that they have engaged in violations of any 3 law or regulations, including but not limited to the FTC Act, or 4 5 that the facts alleged in the Complaint, other than the jurisdictional facts, are true. 6

9. This Order resolves this matter in a manner consistent 7 with the public interest. 8

DEFINITIONS

For purposes of this Order, the following definitions apply:

11 "Defendants" means Wazzu Corporation, Jayme Amirie, Α. 12 Kenneth Gharib and Kirk Waldfogel, and their agents, servants, 13 employees, attorneys, and all persons or entities directly or 14 indirectly under the control of any of them, and all other persons 15 or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or 16 17 otherwise, and each such person;

18 В. "Named Defendants" means Wazzu Corporation, Jayme Amirie, Kenneth Gharib and Kirk Waldfogel; 19

"Corporate Defendant" refers to Named Defendant Wazzu 20 С. 21 Corporation;

22 D. "Individual Defendant[s]" refers to Named Defendants 23 Jayme Amirie, Kenneth Gharib, and Kirk Waldfogel;

Ε. 24 "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope 25 to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), 26 and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, 27 audio and video recordings, computer records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and 28

9

translated, if necessary, through detection devices into
 reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a
 separate document within the meaning of the term;

F. "Material" means likely to affect a person's choice of,
or conduct regarding, goods or services;

G. "Internet" means a worldwide system of linked computer
networks that use a common protocol (TCP/IP) to deliver and
receive information. The "Internet" includes but is not limited
to the following forms of electronic communication: file
transfers, electronic mail, the World Wide Web, newsgroups,
Internet Relay Chat, audio, and video;

H. "Internet services" means any services related to providing access to or advertisements on the Internet, including the provision of e-mail or e-mail to fax service, or creating, designing or hosting any website, webpage, or advertisements on the Internet;

I. A "website" is a set of electronic documents, usually a home page and subordinate pages, readily viewable on computer by anyone with access to the Internet, standard software, and knowledge of the website's location or address; and

J. A "webpage" is a single electronic document within a website, readily viewable on computer by anyone with access to the Internet, standard software, and knowledge of the webpage's or website's location or address.

25 K. A "telemarketing sales vendor" means any company in the 26 business of communicating with consumers over the telephone on 27 behalf of one or more third parties for the purpose of giving

4

sales pitches, taking orders, or otherwise marketing, offering for
 sale, or selling products or services for such third parties.

The term "explicit oral or written authorization" as 3 L. used in Section II of this Order means authorization that is 4 obtained by the consumer providing an unequivocal and affirmative 5 act of assent, such as a "yes" answer, in response to each of the 6 7 terms set forth in Paragraph A of Section II--i.e., method of billing and the amounts to be billed, the amount of any one-time 8 charges, if any, such as a design fee, and the amount and 9 frequency of any recurring charges, such as hosting or access 10 11 fees--in contrast to authorization that may be inferred from a 12 consumer's silence in response to the proposed transaction or to 13 any individual term of the proposed transaction.

<u>ORDER</u>

SECTION I.

REPRESENTATIONS

17 **IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED** that Defendants, directly or through 18 any corporation, subsidiary or other entity or intermediary, in 19 connection with the promotion, advertising, marketing, sale, or 20 offering for sale of any Internet services, are hereby permanently 21 restrained and enjoined from:

A. Falsely representing, expressly or by implication, that
Defendants will not charge consumers before the end of any free
trial period for Internet services;

B. Falsely representing, expressly or by implication, that
Defendants will not charge consumers who cancel before the end of
any free trial period for Internet services;

14

15

16

C. Falsely representing, expressly or by implication, that a consumer is legally obligated to pay charges for Internet services;

D. Falsely representing, expressly or by implication, any
other material fact in connection with charges for Defendants'
Internet services; and

7 E. Falsely representing, expressly or by implication, any8 other material fact.

9

10

SECTION II.

BILLING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants, in connection with any 11 12 telephone communications with a consumer in which any Internet 13 services are offered, promoted or sold, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined, directly or through any corporation, 14 15 subsidiary or other entity or intermediary, from sending a bill 16 for any Internet services to any consumer, or submitting payment 17 information to any third party, such as a billing agent, credit 18 card processing agent, or bank, for processing charges to a consumer for any Internet services --19

A. Prior to the expiration of any applicable free-trial period. Any free-trial period offered by Wazzu pertaining to the ordering of a website shall commence no earlier than five (5) days after Wazzu or anyone acting on its behalf mails or otherwise communicates to the consumer information sufficient to permit the consumer to review the ordered website; and

B. Without having first obtained explicit oral or written
authorization from the consumer that the consumer agrees to the
method of billing and the amounts to be billed, including the

1	amount of any one-time charges, such as a design fee, and the	
2	amount and frequency of any recurring charges, such as hosting or	
3	access fees. Provided, however, that this Paragraph shall not be	
4	construed to prohibit Defendants from	
5	(1) billing charges to a consumer's credit card account	
6	number if:	
7	(i) the consumer has given explicit oral or written	
8	authorization to bill the charges to that credit	
9	card account number; and	
10	(ii) the credit card is subject to the dispute	
11	resolution requirements of the Fair Credit Billing	
12	Act and the Truth in Lending Act, as amended; or	
13	(2) billing a consumer in any manner if the Defendants	
14	have, prior to the date of billing, sent the	
15	consumer a written confirmation of the transaction	
16	to which the consumer agreed over the telephone	
17	that includes all of the following information:	
18	(i) the method of billing to be used;	
19	(ii) the estimated date on which any one-time	
20	charges, if any, will be billed to the	
21	consumer or submitted to a third party for	
22	processing, and the amount of such charges;	
23	(iii)the estimated date on which the first	
24	recurring charge, if any, will be billed to	
25	the consumer or submitted to a third party for	
26	processing, and the amount of such charges;	
27	(iv) the frequency with which recurring charges, if	
28	any, will be billed to the consumer or	

submitted to a third party for processing, and the amount of such charges; and

 (v) the procedure by which the consumer can dispute to Wazzu any matter included in the confirmation and request a refund or credit of charges to which the consumer had not agreed.

7 Provided further that evidence that Defendants have obtained 8 consumers' credit card numbers or sent consumers a written 9 confirmation in the manner described above will be considered but 10 shall not necessarily be conclusive in any proceeding to determine 11 whether the Defendants have violated Section I.C. of this Order.

1

2

3

4

5

б

12

13

SECTION III.

CONSUMER REDRESS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Named Defendants shall engage one or more independent third-parties (collectively, "Administrator"), approved by the Commission's representatives, to administer a redress program as described below, at Named Defendants' own expense:

19 Within thirty (30) days following entry of this Order, Α. Named Defendants shall provide the Administrator and the 20 undersigned counsel for the Commission with an affidavit or 21 declaration that includes a list of the name and last known 22 address and telephone number, including the Billing Telephone 23 Number ("BTN"), of every consumer qualified to receive a notice 24 25 package, as described below. Consumers qualified to receive a 26 notice package include all consumers who either (i) were being 27 billed for Wazzu's services through a local exchange carrier ("LEC") as of June 7, 1999 or (ii) have been LEC billed between 28

June 7, 1999 and the date the Named Defendants signed this Order,
 with the exception of any consumer--

1. who has converted to credit card billing; or 3 2. who has converted to payment by electronic transfer 4 5 of funds; or 3. for whom a full credit has been transmitted б 7 directly or through the LEC billing system for all charges for Wazzu's Internet services; or 8 4. who has, after the expiration of their thirty-day 9

10

11

12

13

14

- free trial period, engaged their website administration feature; or
 - 5. who has, after the expiration of their thirty-day free trial period, engaged their e-mail address selection feature.

15 Named Defendants may generate the list of qualified consumers by 16 using information in Wazzu's customer database records, provided 17 that one of the individual Defendants with personal knowledge 18 provides an affidavit or declaration that truthfully states: (i) 19 whether there is any reason to believe that the information or 20 method used may not or did not generate an accurate list of 21 consumers qualified to receive a notice package; and (ii) if 22 applicable, how and the extent to which the information or method used did not or may not generate an accurate list. If a means 23 24 other than using information in Wazzu's customer database records 25 is used, the affidavit or declaration shall state the method that 26 was used to generate the list of qualified consumers.

B. Within sixty (60) days following entry of this Order,
the Administrator shall mail a notice package to every consumer

identified on the list of consumers qualified to receive a notice 1 package. The notice package, which shall have been approved in 2 advance by the Commission's representatives, shall consist of a 3 written notice, reply form, and self-addressed postage-paid return 4 5 envelope addressed to Wazzu at an address maintained by the Administrator. The Administrator shall retain a sample of the 6 7 actual form letter, including the enclosures, that is sent to consumers, to be provided to Commission counsel upon request, and 8 records showing the date on which the mailings were sent. 9

C. The Administrator shall keep records showing the names of consumers whose notice packages are returned by the Post Office as undeliverable and shall make a reasonable effort to obtain valid addresses for such consumers so that the notice packages can be re-mailed, including placing a call to the BTN provided by the Named Defendants and asking for a current address, and using the National Change of Address registry.

17 D. The Administrator shall review and evaluate consumers' 18 eligibility for redress in accordance with the criteria set forth 19 To the extent that a consumer's eligibility cannot be below. 20 determined solely from the consumer's reply form, the Administrator shall call the consumer and make a follow-up attempt 21 22 to make the determination. A consumer shall be determined eligible for redress if the consumer: 23

Returns a signed reply form postmarked within forty
 (40) days following the date on which the notice package was
 mailed to the consumer; and

27 2. Indicates on the reply form that the consumer wants
28 to cancel Wazzu's service or halt all charges; and

13. Provides an explanation on the reply form as to the2reason the consumer wants to cancel Wazzu's service; and

4. Indicates in either the explanation on the reply
form, or, if the explanation on the reply form is insufficient to
determine eligibility, in a subsequent statement signed under
penalty of perjury and provided to the Administrator, that:

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

- a. one or more unauthorized charges for Wazzu's services appeared on the consumer's telephone bill; or
- the consumer canceled within Wazzu's free trial period but was nonetheless charged; or
- c. the consumer was charged for Wazzu's services even though he was told he would not be charged unless he notified Wazzu after the free trial period that he wanted to continue with the service; or
 - d. the consumer was charged even though he never received any written materials or any notification that his Wazzu website was available for review.

E. Within one hundred forty (140) days following entry of this Order, the Administrator shall provide to Commission counsel and to Named Defendants (i) a list of consumers that the Administrator has determined to be eligible to receive redress (the "preliminary eligibility list"), and (ii) copies of all reply forms and other written statements received from consumers.

F. Named Defendants may review the preliminary eligibilitylist and eliminate from the list the name of any consumer who has

already been issued a full credit or refund, provided that the 1 Named Defendants first provide Commission counsel an affidavit or 2 declaration truthfully stating that, with respect to each consumer 3 whose name the Named Defendants have removed from the preliminary 4 eligibility list, Wazzu has already (i) arranged for the 5 appropriate billing agent or service to transmit a full credit to 6 7 the consumer; (ii) provided a full credit or refund directly to the consumer; or (iii) received information, from either a billing 8 service or a LEC, indicating that a full credit has been provided 9 10 to the consumer.

Named Defendants shall, within thirty (30) days 11 G. 12 following receipt of the preliminary eligibility list from the 13 Administrator, take all steps necessary to (i) arrange for the appropriate billing agent or service to transmit a full credit to 14 15 each consumer whose name was included on the preliminary 16 eligibility list and not eliminated pursuant to the preceding 17 Paragraph, or (ii) provide full credits or refunds directly to 18 such consumers. Named Defendants shall make and keep records reflecting the efforts taken to effectuate the credits or refunds, 19 and shall, between thirty (30) and forty-five (45) days following 20 receipt of the list of eligible consumers from the Administrator, 21 22 prepare an affidavit or declaration stating the efforts taken to comply with this Paragraph. 23

H. The Administrator shall, between thirty (30) and sixty
(60) days after providing the preliminary eligibility list to
Named Defendants, review the efforts taken by Named Defendants to
ensure that Named Defendants have taken the necessary steps to
comply with Paragraph G, above.

I. The Administrator shall, within twenty (20) business
 days of completing the review described in Paragraph H above,
 provide a report to the Commission and to Named Defendants
 describing the efforts taken by the Administrator and the results
 of its review of the Named Defendants' efforts to comply with
 Paragraph G, above.

J. Named Defendants are responsible for ensuring that the
Administrator performs all tasks as specified in this Section.
Should the Administrator be unable or fail to comply with any
provision in this Section, Named Defendants shall make alternative
arrangements, subject to the approval of the Commission or its
representatives, for timely accomplishment of such tasks.

13 K. Within fifteen (15) business days of receiving from the 14 Administrator the report required by Paragraph I, above, the 15 Commission shall either-

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- (1) provide written notice to counsel for Named Defendants, and to the Escrow Agent named in the Escrow Agreement attached hereto as Attachment A holding \$12,932.41 in escrow to secure payment of redress under this Section, that the funds are divested and may be returned to the Named Defendants; or
- (2) provide written notice to counsel for Named Defendants and to the Court that the Commission is moving the Court to require Named Defendants to show cause why they should not be held in contempt for their failure to comply with this Section.

In the event the Court finds that Named Defendants have not 1 complied with Paragraph G of this Section, funds held in escrow 2 pursuant to the Escrow Agreement set forth in Attachment A shall 3 be released to the Commission in the amount necessary to provide 4 refunds to all consumers who were to receive credits or refunds 5 pursuant to Paragraph G but who have not in fact received such 6 credits or refunds. The Commission shall then use such funds to 7 provide refunds to such consumers. Any funds remaining in escrow 8 after all eligible consumers have received full refunds shall be 9 divested and returned to the Named Defendants. 10

SECTION IV.

11

12

RECORDKEEPING

13 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, corporate Defendant Wazzu, 14 and each individual Defendant in connection with any business 15 16 where the Defendant individually or jointly with any other 17 individual Defendant is the majority owner of the business or 18 directly or indirectly manages or controls the business and where the business engages in the promotion, marketing, offering for 19 sale, or sale of Internet services, are hereby restrained and 20 21 enjoined from failing to create or maintain the following:

A. Books, records and accounts which, in reasonable detail,
accurately and fairly reflect the cost of goods or services sold,
and the income, disbursements, transactions and use of funds.

B. Records accurately reflecting the following: (i) the name, address, and phone number of each person who the business employs in any capacity, each person the business retains as a directly hired independent contractor to conduct or assist with

telemarketing, each telemarketing sales vendor directly retained 1 by the business, and each telemarketing sales vendor that has been 2 retained by any third party with which the business has contracted 3 for the purpose of managing, supervising or contracting with 4 5 telemarketing sales vendors; and (ii) if a person, that person's job title or position; (iii) the date upon which the person or 6 7 company commenced work; and (iv) the date and reason for the person's or company's termination, if applicable. Defendants 8 shall retain such records for any terminated employee or company 9 10 for a period of two years following the date of termination.

C. Records containing the names, addresses, phone numbers,
and dollar amounts paid, for all consumers to whom Named
Defendants have sold Internet services.

D. Records that contain or reflect, for every written consumer complaint or refund request, whether received directly or indirectly or through any third party, including complaints and refund requests submitted by mail, courier, fax or e-mail, and for every oral consumer complaint or refund request conveyed by consumers calling any telephone number provided by the business for customer service inquiries:

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- The consumer's name, address, and telephone number and the dollar amount paid by the consumer;
- The written complaint or refund request, if any, and the date of the complaint or refund request;
- 3. The basis of the complaint, including the name of any salesperson complained against, and the nature and result of any investigation conducted concerning the validity of the complaint;

- Each response by the business and the date of the response;
 - 5. Any final resolution and the date of the resolution; and
 - In the event of a denial of a refund request, the reason for the denial.

E. Copies of all (i) telemarketing sales scripts,

(ii) telemarketing training packets, (iii) written communications, 8 with any telemarketing sales vendor retained by the business or 9 10 with any third party with which the business has contracted for 11 the purpose of managing, supervising or contracting with 12 independent telemarketing sales vendors, regarding representations 13 to consumers, obtaining authorization from consumers, or 14 telemarketing sales techniques or practices, and (iv) the caller-15 paid and/or toll-free telephone numbers utilized by the business 16 in furtherance of any telemarketing of Internet services.

F. All contracts and agreements with any telemarketing sales vendor retained by the business or with any third party with which the business has contracted for the purpose of managing, supervising or contracting with independent telemarketing sales vendors.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that all documents that are required to be created or maintained under this Section shall be retained for three (3) years following the date on which the document was created or came into the Named Defendant's possession, custody or control.

27

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

28

SECTION V.

DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

3 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of three (3) years 4 from the date of entry of this Order, corporate Defendant Wazzu, 5 and each individual Defendant in connection with any business where the Defendant individually or jointly with any other 6 7 individual Defendant is the majority owner of the business or directly or indirectly manages or controls the business and where 8 the business engages in the promotion, marketing, offering for 9 10 sale, or sale of Internet services, shall:

A. Provide:

1

2

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1. a copy of this Order to each officer and director of the business, and each individual at the business serving in a management capacity, within ten (10) business days of entry of this Order and thereafter immediately upon employing or retaining any such persons, and within ten (10) business days of providing a copy of this Order pursuant to this Paragraph obtain a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of same from each person to whom it is required to be distributed; and

2. an accurate summary, conforming to the model set forth in Attachment B, of Section I of the Order to each person or company the business employs in a telemarketing capacity, to each person the business retains as a directly hired independent contractor to conduct or assist with telemarketing, to each telemarketing sales vendor directly retained by the

business, and to each third party with which the business has contracted for the purpose of managing, supervising or contracting with telemarketing sales vendors, within ten (10) business days of entry of this Order and thereafter immediately upon employing or retaining any such persons, and obtain a signed and dated acknowledgment of receipt of same, within ten (10) business days of providing the summary pursuant to this Paragraph, from each person to whom it is required to be distributed;

12 Provided, however, that the Defendants shall, upon the 13 request of any person who has received a summary pursuant to this Paragraph, promptly provide such person 14 15 with a copy of the complete Order; and provided further 16 that Named Defendants shall be jointly and severally 17 liable to comply with this Paragraph, such that only one 18 copy of this Order, or a summary thereof, need be 19 distributed to any particular person.

1

2

3

4

5

б

7

8

9

10

11

25

26

B. Maintain for a period of three (3) years after creation, and upon reasonable notice make available to representatives of the Commission, the original signed and dated acknowledgments of the receipts of copies of this Order or the summary required in Paragraph A of this Section.

SECTION VI.

MONITORING COMPLIANCE OF SALES PERSONNEL

27 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that corporate Defendant Wazzu, and
28 each individual Defendant in connection with any business where

the Defendant individually or jointly with any other individual Defendant is the majority owner of the business or directly or indirectly manages or controls the business and where the business engages in the promotion, marketing, offering for sale, or sale of Internet services, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from:

7 Α. Failing to take reasonable steps sufficient to monitor and ensure that all persons and companies that engage or 8 participate in telemarketing sales, billing, or responding to 9 10 consumer complaints with respect to Internet services offered by Wazzu or the Defendant, are complying with Sections I and II of 11 12 this Order. Such steps shall include, at a minimum, the 13 following: (1) refusing to honor, accept, compensate for, or bill any consumer for, any sale of Internet services submitted from or 14 15 through any employee, any telemarketing sales vendor directly 16 retained by the business, or any other company with which the 17 business has contracted for the purpose of managing, supervising 18 or contracting with telemarketing sales vendors, that has not received a copy of this Order or a summary conforming to 19 Attachment B of this Order; (2) maintaining a procedure for 20 21 receiving and responding to consumer complaints; and (3) for each 22 employee, telemarketing sales vendor, or third party with which the business has contracted for the purpose of managing, 23 24 supervising or contracting with telemarketing sales vendors that 25 is implicated in a consumer complaint, ascertaining the number and nature of consumer complaints regarding transactions in which the 26 27 employee, telemarketing sales vendor or third party is involved;

B. Failing promptly to investigate fully any consumer
 complaint relating to telemarketing received by the business;

3 C. Failing to take corrective action with respect to any sales person or any telemarketing sales vendor whom the Defendant 4 5 has reason to believe has made misrepresentations to consumers or has determined is not acting in accordance with the requirements 6 7 of Section I of this Order, which may include training, disciplining, refusing to do further business with, and/or 8 terminating such sales person or vendor, provided that this 9 Section does not authorize or require Defendants to take any steps 10 that violate any federal, state, or local laws. 11

SECTION VII.

12

13

COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANTS

14 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the 15 provisions of this Order may be monitored:

A. The individual Defendants shall, for a period of three
(3) years from the date of entry of this Order, notify the
Commission of:

Any changes in the Defendant's residence, mailing
 address, and telephone numbers, within ten (10) business days of
 the date of such change; and

22 2. Any changes in the Defendant's employment status 23 (including self-employment) within ten (10) days of such change. 24 Such notice shall include the name and address of each business 25 that the Defendant is affiliated with or employed by, a statement 26 of the nature of the business, and a statement of the Defendant's 27 duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or 28 employment;

Named Defendants shall notify the Commission of any 1 Β. proposed change in the structure of Wazzu, such as dissolution, 2 assignment, sale, merger, creation or dissolution of subsidiaries, 3 proposed filing of a bankruptcy petition, or change in the 4 corporate name or address, or any other change that may affect 5 compliance obligations arising out of this Order, thirty (30) days 6 7 prior to the effective date of any proposed change; provided, however, that, with respect to any proposed change in the 8 corporation about which Named Defendants learn less than thirty 9 10 (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, or that 11 is to occur less than thirty (30) days after the final decision to 12 make such change has been made, Named Defendants shall notify the 13 Commission as soon as is practicable after learning of such proposed change or the final decision to make such change has been 14 15 made;

C. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order, Named Defendants shall provide a written report to the FTC, sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which they are complying with this Order and, with the exception of Section III, have complied with this Order. This report shall include but not be limited to:

The Defendant's then current residence address and
 telephone number;

24 2. The Defendant's then current employment, business 25 addresses and telephone numbers, a description of the business 26 activities of each such employer, and the Defendant's title and 27 responsibilities for each employer;

28

3. A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this
 Order, and each summary thereof, obtained by Defendant pursuant to
 Section V of this Order;

4 4. A statement describing the manner in which the
5 Defendant has complied and is complying with Sections I and II of
6 this Order;

D. Upon written request by a representative of the Commission, Named Defendants shall submit additional written reports (under oath, if requested) and produce documents on twenty (20) business days' notice, or such other mutually agreed to period of time, with respect to any conduct subject to this Order, subject to the Defendants' right to seek a protective order from the court for good cause shown;

E. For the purposes of this Order, Named Defendants shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, mail all written notifications to the Commission to:

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Assistant Regional Director Federal Trade Commission 10877 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024 Re: FTC v. Wazzu

F. For purposes of the compliance reporting required by this Section, the Commission is authorized to communicate with Defendants' undersigned counsel, Brobeck, Phleger & Harrison LLP, unless and until the undersigned counsel advises the Commission, in accordance with Paragraph E of this Section, that communications regarding compliance reporting should be directed to another specified party.

SECTION VIII.

1 2

COMMISSION'S AUTHORITY TO MONITOR COMPLIANCE

3 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Commission is authorized to monitor the Named Defendants' compliance with this Order by all 4 5 lawful means. Such means include, but are not limited to, obtaining discovery, without further leave of court but with 6 7 timely written notice to Named Defendants pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 5, from any person in the manner provided by Chapter V of the 8 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Fed. R. Civ. P. 26 - 37, 9 10 including the use of compulsory process pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. 11 P. 45, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating Named 12 Defendants' compliance with any provision of this Order, subject 13 to Rules 26(c), 45(c) and any other provision of the Federal Rules 14 of Civil Procedure providing the person with the right to seek relief from the Court. 15

Nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to investigate whether any of the Named Defendants has violated any provision of this Order or Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45.

SECTION IX.

ACCESS TO BUSINESS PREMISES

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, for the purpose of further determining compliance with this Order, Named Defendants shall permit representatives of the Commission, within three (3) business days of receipt of written notice from the Commission:

28

21

22

Access during normal business hours to Wazzu's offices 1 Α. 2 or any facility storing its documents. In providing such access, Named Defendants shall permit representatives of the Commission to 3 inspect and copy all documents relevant to any matter contained in 4 5 this Order; and shall permit Commission representatives to remove (i) non-business critical documents relevant to any matter 6 7 contained in this Order for a period not to exceed five (5) business days, and (ii) documents deemed business critical by 8 Wazzu for a period not to exceed twenty-four (24) hours or such 9 10 other period as agreed to by Wazzu and the Commission's 11 representatives, so that the documents may be inspected, 12 inventoried, and copied, with all documents removed to be returned 13 to Wazzu in good order. Provided that, upon application of the 14 Commission and for good cause shown, the Court may enter an ex 15 parte order granting immediate access to Wazzu's business premises 16 for the purposes of inspecting and copying all documents relevant 17 to any matter contained in this Order.

18 в. To interview, at Wazzu's place of business or a similarly convenient location, the officers, directors, and 19 20 employees, including all personnel involved in responding to 21 consumer complaints or inquiries, and all sales personnel, whether 22 designated as employees, consultants, independent contractors or otherwise, of Wazzu concerning matters relating to compliance with 23 the terms of this Order, upon written request by a representative 24 25 of the Commission through Wazzu's counsel. The person interviewed 26 may have counsel present.

27

1	SECTION X.	
2	ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT	
3	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, within five (5) business days	
4	after Named Defendants receive this Order as entered by the Court,	
5	each Named Defendant shall submit to the Commission a truthful	
6	sworn and notarized statement, in the form shown on Appendix 1,	
7	that shall acknowledge receipt of this Final Order.	
8	SECTION XI.	
9	INDEPENDENCE OF OBLIGATIONS	
10	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the expiration of any requirements	
11	imposed by this Order shall not affect any other obligation	
12	arising under this Order.	
13	SECTION XII.	
14	COSTS AND ATTORNEYS FEES	
15	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that each party to this Order bear its	
16	own costs and attorneys fees incurred in connection with this	
17	action.	
18	/ / /	
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	25	

-		
1	SECTION	
2		JURISDICTION
3	IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the	
4	jurisdiction of this matter for all purposes.	
5	STIPULATED AND AGREED BY:	
6	Dated:	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
7		John D. Jacobs Tanya Mayorkas
8		
9		Attorneys for Plaintiff
10 11	Dated:	WAZZU CORPORATION
11 12		By: Jayme Amirie, Chief
13		Executive Officer
14	Dated:	
15	Dated:	Jayme Amirie Defendant
16	Dated:	
17	Juccu.	Kenneth Gharib Defendant
18		
19		Kirk Waldfogel Defendant
20		COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANTS
21		
22	Dated:	Michael B. Green
23		Brobeck, Phleger & Harrison LLP
24		Attorneys for Defendants One Market, Spear Street Tower
25		San Francisco, CA 94105 (415) 442-0900
26	IT IS SO ORDERED	
27	Dated:	
28		United States District Judge
	2	6
		~

[ATTACHMENT A]

ESCROW AGREEMENT

WHEREAS Wazzu Corporation, Jayme Amirie, Kenneth Gharib, and Kirk Waldfogel ("Defendants") have offered to settle charges of alleged violations of the Federal Trade Commission Act by signing and agreeing to entry of the proposed Stipulated Final Order for Permanent Injunction and Other Equitable Relief ("proposed Order") attached to this Escrow Agreement as Exhibit 1, and staff of the Los Angeles office of the Western Region of the Federal Trade Commission have agreed, contingent upon the Defendants' appropriate execution of this Escrow Agreement and transfer of funds into escrow, to recommend to the Federal Trade Commission ("Commission") that it authorize staff to file the proposed Order with the United States District Court for the Central District of California ("District Court") as settlement of such charges;

WHEREAS the proposed Order provides that Defendants will issue credits or refunds to qualified consumers who appropriately complete and submit reply forms establishing they are eligible under the terms of the proposed Order for credits or refunds;

WHEREAS Defendants have agreed to pay \$12,932.41 into an escrow account not later than five (5) business days after Defendants sign the proposed Order and have agreed that such funds shall be held there pending approval of the proposed Order by the Federal Trade Commission and entry of the proposed Order by the District Court, and, in the event the proposed Order is entered by the District Court, distributed in accordance with its terms:

NOW, THEREFORE, in consideration of the premises and mutual covenants, agreements and conditions contained in this Escrow Agreement, the Defendants and FTC staff do hereby agree as follows:

1. Southern California Bank Escrow agrees to serve as the Escrow Agent. The Defendants shall transfer \$12,932.41 to the Escrow Agent, within five business days after they have signed the proposed Order, by electronic transfer or certified or cashier's check. The Escrow Agent shall hold this sum (the "Escrow Fund") in trust for consumers, for distribution in accordance with the terms of this Escrow Agreement.

2. It is understood and agreed by the parties to this Escrow Agreement that by signing this Escrow Agreement, the Defendants relinquish all dominion, control and title to the Escrow fund, and that all legal and equitable title to the Escrow fund is vested in consumers eligible to receive redress as set forth under the terms of the proposed Order; subject to being divested under the following circumstances:

- a.. in the event the proposed Order is rejected by the Commission or the District Court; or
- b. in the event the proposed Order is approved by the Commission and entered by the District Court and, pursuant to Section III of the Order, the Commission notifies the Escrow Agent and counsel for the Defendants that the Escrow fund is divested and that all monies in the Escrow fund may be returned to Defendants.

Provided that in the event that the Escrow fund is used to pay refunds to consumers pursuant to Section III.K of the Order, any funds remaining in escrow after all eligible consumers have received full refunds shall be divested and returned to the Named Defendants.

3. The Defendants agree not to make a claim to or demand for the return of the Escrow fund, directly or indirectly, unless the Escrow fund or any part thereof is divested as described in the

preceding paragraph of this Escrow Agreement. In the event of bankruptcy of any Defendant such Defendant agrees to acknowledge and verify in an appropriate manner to the bankruptcy court or to any other authority, and hereby also acknowledges and verifies, that neither the Escrow fund nor any part thereof is part of the debtor's estate, and that the estate does not have any claim or interest therein.

4. In the event the proposed Order is approved by the Commission and entered by the District Court, the Escrow Agent shall not distribute or return any portion of the Escrow fund prior to receiving either notice from the Commission that the Escrow fund is divested and that all monies in the Escrow fund may be returned to Defendants, or a copy of an order from the District Court directing the Escrow Agent to release funds to the Commission or to distribute all or any portion of the funds in any other manner. In the event the Escrow Agent receives notice from the Commission that the Escrow fund is divested and that all monies in the Escrow fund is divested and that all monies in the Escrow fund may be returned to Defendants, the Escrow Agent shall return all monies in the Escrow fund to the Defendants. In the event the Escrow Agent receives a copy of an order from the District Court regarding disposition of all or any portion of the Escrow fund, the Escrow Agent shall comply with the requirements of the order.

5. The escrow shall be irrevocable, and the Escrow fund shall be used for no purpose other than providing refunds as set forth in the Stipulated Final Order. Any interest earned on the escrow principal during the pendency of the escrow shall accrue to the Escrow fund and shall be paid out, and shall be subject to being divested, in the same manner as the principal.

1 2	In witness whereof, each of the parties ha the case of the individually defendants, personally behalf by its duly authorized representative.	is caused this Escrow Agreement to be executed, in y, and, in the case of the corporate defendant, on it
3		
4	Dated:	Jayme Amirie Individual Defendant
5		Individual Defendant
6	Dated:	Kenneth Gharib
7		Individual Defendant
8	Dated:	Kirk Waldfogel Individual Defendant
9	Dated:	WAZZU CORPORATION
10		
11		By: Jayme Amirie, Chief Executive Officer
12	Dated:	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
13		By: John D. Jacobs
14		John D. Jacobs Attorney for Plaintiff
15		-
16	Dated:	SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA BANK ESCROW
17		Ву:
18		Escrow Agent
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
		29

I

I

[ATTACHMENT B]

NOTICE TO SALES PERSONNEL

A federal court order, which was entered without any finding or admission of wrongdoing, prohibits Wazzu Corporation, Jayme Amirie, Kenneth Gharib and Kirk Waldfogel, and their employees, and all other persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of the following requirements, from making any misrepresentation of material fact, either expressly or by implication, orally or in writing, in connection with the promotion, advertising, marketing, offering for sale, or sale of Internet services.

The order specifically prohibits making any of the following representations, unless the representation is true at the time it is made:

A. Consumers will not be charged before the end of any free trial period for Internet services;

B. Consumers who cancel before the end of any free trial period for Internet services will not be charged ; and

C. A consumer is legally obligated to pay charges for Internet services.

You must comply with these prohibitions. A copy of the court order is available upon request. The order was issued in <u>FTC v. Wazzu Corp.</u>, CV-99-13114-FMC (CWx) (U.S. District Court, C.D. Cal.), in a case brought by the Federal Trade Commission. The order was entered without any finding or admission of wrongdoing.

1	[APPENDIX 1]			
2				
3				
4				
5				
6				
7				
8	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT			
9 10				
11				
12	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,) CV-99-13114-FMC (CWx)			
13	Plaintiff,) AFFIDAVIT OF DEFENDANT [NAME]) AFFIRMING RECEIPT OF STIPULATED			
14	v.) FINAL ORDER			
15	WAZZU CORPORATION, et al.,)) Defendants.)			
16)			
17	I, [name], being duly sworn, hereby states and affirms as			
18	follows:			
19	1. My name is [name]. My current residence address is			
20	I am a citizen of the			
21	United States and am over the age of eighteen. I have personal			
22	knowledge of the facts set forth in this Affidavit.			
23	2. I am a defendant in FTC v. Wazzu Corporation, et al.,			
24 25	(United States District Court for the Central District of			
25 26	California, Western Division, CV-99-13114 FMC).			
20	3. On [date], I received a copy of the STIPULATED FINAL			
28	ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND OTHER EQUITABLE RELIEF,			
	31			
	J L			

I

which was signed by the Honorable Florence-Marie Cooper and
 entered by the Court on [date of entry of Order]. A true and
 correct copy of the Order I received is appended to this
 Affidavit.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the
United States that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on
[date], at [city and state].

[signature] [name

State of _____, City of _____

Subscribed and sworn to before me this _____ day of _____, 20____.

Notary Public My Commission Expires: